

DRAFT

*has not been approved
by the BOA.*

Minutes of the Board of Agriculture



**Department
of Agriculture**
STATE OF HAWAII

1
2
3
4
5
6
7 I. CALL TO ORDER – The meeting of the Board of Agriculture was called to order on February
8 24, 2015 at 9:02 a.m. by Board of Agriculture Chairperson Scott Enright, at the Plant Quarantine
9 Conference Room, 1849 Auiki Street, Honolulu, Hawaii 96819.

10
11 Members Present:

12
13 Scott Enright, Chairperson, Board of Agriculture
14 Jerry Ornellas, Kauai Member
15 Scott Derrickson, Department of Business, Economic Development and Tourism, Ex
16 Officio Member
17 Dr. Maria Gallo, Dean of the College of Tropical Agriculture & Human Resources
18 University of Hawaii (CTAHR-UH), Ex Officio Member
19 Glenn Hong, Member-At-Large
20 Michelle Galimba, Member-At-Large
21 Richard Ha, Hawaii Member
22

23 Members Absent:

24
25 Carty Chang, Acting Chairperson, Board of Land and Natural Resources
26 Clark Hashimoto, Member-At-Large
27

28 Others Present:

29
30 Randy Teruya, Agricultural Asset Manager, Hawaii Department of Agriculture (HDOA)
31 Agricultural Resource Management Division (ARMD)
32 Randall Chang, HDOA/ARMD
33 Dr. Neil Reimer, HDOA/Plant Industry Division Administrator
34 Cathy Goeggel, Animal Rights Hawaii
35 Trenton Yasui, HDOA Plant Quarantine Branch (PQB)
36 Janelle Saneishi, HDOA Chairperson's Office (CHR)
37 Ken Kakesako, HDOA/ CHR
38 Amy Takahashi, HDOA/PQB Acting Manager
39 Andrew Goff, Deputy Attorney General
40 Haunani Burns, Deputy Attorney General
41 Dean Matsukawa, HDOA/Agricultural Loan Division Administrator
42 Kevin Yokoyama, HDOA/Agricultural Loan Division
43 Derek Lanter, Dole Waialua Coffee
44 Jim Anthony, Private Citizen
45 Candace Whiting, Private Citizen
46 Howard Green, Green World Farm
47 Wayne Katayama, Kauai Coffee Co. LLC
48 Jeri Kahana, HDOA/Quality Assurance Division (QAD) Administrator
49 William Cole, Star Advertiser
50 Chris Kishimoto, HDOA/PQB
51 Lance Sakaino, HDOA/PQB

- 1 Theresa Manzano, HDOA/PQB
- 2 Mimi Foreyk, Private Citizen
- 3 Jonathan Ho, HDOA/PQB
- 4 Jim Wayman, Hawaii Coffee Association
- 5 Grant Tomita, HDOA/QAD
- 6 Tierra Rapoza, Private Citizen
- 7 William Sanchez, Private Citizen
- 8 Darcy Oishi, HDOA/Plant Industry Division
- 9 Shaun Steiman, 8 Daylight Mind Coffee Company

10
11 II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM 1/27/15 MEETING

12
13 Chairperson asked for a motion to approve the minutes from the Board’s January 27, 2015
14 meeting.

15
16 Motion: Gallo/Ha

17
18 Vote: Approved, 6/0, Board member Hong absent.

19
20 III. COMMENTS FROM THE GENERAL PUBLIC ON AGENDA ITEMS (ORAL OR
21 WRITTEN)

22
23 Chairperson said that comments would be taken along with each agenda item.
24

25 IV. INTRODUCTION AND COMMENTS

26
27 V. COMMUNICATIONS FROM DIVISIONS AND ADMINISTRATION

28
29 A. AGRICULTURAL LOAN DIVISION

- 30
31 1. Request for Approval of One (1) Direct Farm Ownership and
32 Improvement Loan and One (1) Direct Operating Loan to William J.
33 Sanchez.
34

35 Presentation by Kevin Yokoyama, Loan Officer, Agricultural Loan Division, as submitted. The
36 \$800,000 farm ownership and improvement loan will be used to construct a chill/processing
37 facility to complement a slaughter facility located on Mr. Sanchez’s property. The \$250,000
38 operating loan will purchase equipment and provide operating capital. The applicant has been
39 operating his own cattle ranch for many years and is experienced at operating a slaughter
40 facility.
41

42 Motion made to take up staff’s recommendation: Ornellas/Galimba

43
44 Mr. Sanchez said that in Kauai there are limited options for those who would like to slaughter
45 their livestock and so he decided to take the lead by opening a slaughterhouse. His projections
46 are good so far, as markets want grass fed beef rather than importing livestock from the
47 mainland.
48

49 Chairperson Enright asked what the projected capacity of the slaughterhouse would be.

1
2 Mr. Sanchez said that the slaughterhouse will be able to do 15 to 20 head of cattle a day and
3 has the chill space to hang 75 carcasses in three coolers. There is also a freezer and cutting
4 room.

5
6 Board member Ornellas said that a number of good studies were generated by the previous
7 effort of trying to open a slaughterhouse in Kauai that identified the need for a slaughterhouse.
8 Kauai County also has potential business plans for such a slaughterhouse. Board member
9 Ornellas said that Mr. Sanchez is experienced in the business.

10
11 Chairperson Enright said that he had a chance to visit Mr. Sanchez's operation and commended
12 him on his pasture management.

13
14 Vote: Approved, 6/0. Board member Hong absent.

- 15
16 2. Request that One (1) Loan to Bounlang and Bouarpha Boutsady be
17 Referred to the Attorney General for Disposition and/or Collection
18

19 Presentation by Kevin Yokoyama, Loan Officer, Agricultural Loan Division, as submitted. The
20 \$20,000 loan was made in 2007 for five years.

21
22 Motion made to take up staff's recommendation: Galimba/Gallo
23

24 Board member Derrickson asked if there was any opportunity for the farmer to work with
25 Campbell to have access to equipment.

26
27 Mr. Yokoyama said, "Not at this time."
28

29 Board member Galimba asked if it would be difficult to collect and whether the Attorney
30 General's Office would be able to do so.
31

32 Mr. Dean Matsukawa, Agricultural Loan Division Administrator, said that they have a good
33 chance of collecting the money due, as the loan holders have their own property and will most
34 likely respond if they receive a letter from the Attorney General's Office.
35

36 Vote: Approved, 6/0. Board member Hong absent.
37

38 B. AGRICULTURAL RESOURCE MANAGEMENT DIVISION
39

- 40 1. Request For Consent to Assignment of General Lease
41 No. S-1012, Lot 12, from Alfred W.F. Kam, Sr. to Glory
42 Herb Farm LLC; TMK (1) 8-5-034:012, Waianae Agricultural
43 Park, Waianae, Island of Oahu
44

45 Presentation by Randall Chang, Agricultural Resource Management Division Property Manager,
46 as submitted.
47

48 Motion made to take up staff's recommendation: Ha/Galimba.
49

1 Board member Derrickson asked why the \$20,000 in back rent was still owed and how that
2 would be taken care of.

3
4 Mr. Chang said that the outstanding rent would be paid out of the sale proceeds through the
5 escrow process before the assignment is finalized.

6
7 Vote: Approved, 6/0. Board member Hong absent.

- 8
9 2. Request For Consent to Assignment of General Lease
10 No. S-6013, Lot 13; For Nancy Oupraxay; TMK (1) 5-6-006:041,
11 Kahuku Agricultural Park, Kahuku, Island of Oahu

12
13 Presentation by Randall Chang, Agricultural Resource Management Division Property Manager,
14 as submitted. The lessee, for health reasons, is unable to develop his lot as planned. The
15 proposed assignee currently has a successful farm in Waianae and this lease assignment will
16 help expand their operation and increase production.

17
18 Motion made to take up staff's recommendation: Galimba/Gallo.

19
20 Vote: Approved, 6/0. Board member Hong absent.

21
22 Chairperson called for a recess at 9:20 AM.

23 Meeting reconvened at 9:24 AM.

24
25 C. PLANT INDUSTRY DIVISION

- 26
27 1. Request for Preliminary Approval of Proposed Amendment to Chapter
28 4-70, Hawaii Administrative Rules, Entitled, "Plants and Non-Domestic Animal
29 Quarantine, Plant Import Rules," to Add a New Subchapter to Restrict the
30 Importation of Myrtaceae (Myrtle Family) Plants and Plant Parts to Prevent the
31 Introduction of New Strains of 'Ohi'a rust, *Puccinia psidii*, a Plant Pathogen. (See
32 Attachment for Summary of Proposed New Rule Subchapter)

33
34 Chairperson Enright said that the Board previously acted on this rule at a previous meeting but
35 is taking up the subject again to insure the process is being properly followed.

36
37 Presentation by Mr. Lance Sakaino, Acting PQB Plant Specialist, as submitted. Mr. Sakaino
38 summarized the submittal, including the record of the destructive impact of Ohi'a rust, *Puccinia*
39 *psidii*, on plants in the *Myrtaceae* family, a potentially very broad host range in Hawaii and
40 elsewhere (guava in Brazil, allspice in Florida.) The broad host range raises concerns for the
41 health of many other *Myrtaceae* plants, especially the endemic ohi`a that makes up about 80%
42 of the native forests in Hawaii. The `ohi`a rust strain present in Hawaii was very virulent to Rose
43 Apple but only caused modest damage to mature `ohi`a. However, recent research shows that
44 strains of *P. psidii* in other locations, but that do not presently exist in Hawaii, have been shown
45 to have serious impact on `ohi`a plants. The concern is that if an additional strain of *P. psidii*
46 reaches Hawaii, the results could be devastating to the native forests and, thus, to watershed
47 and cultural resources throughout Hawaii.

48
49 Acting Plant Specialist Sakaino read aloud the Board's agenda attachment for this item that
50 describes what each of the three rule sections proposed to regulate *Myrtaceae import* would do.

1 (section 4-70-55, Notice of quarantine; section 4-70-56, Prohibited introduction; and section 4-
2 70-57, Permits).

3
4 Motion to take up staff's recommendation: Hong/Gallo.

5
6 Board member Ornellas asked if the rule would have an impact on Eucalyptus that is being
7 brought to Hawaii for forestry.

8
9 Dr. Neil Reimer, Plant Industry Division Administrator, said that Eucalyptus would be regulated
10 under the proposed rules, but would be allowed to be brought in as long as the quarantine
11 process was being followed and the importer met requirements. Dr. Reimer mentioned that
12 tissue cultured plants are allowed under the rule. He said that the Division has been in
13 discussion with the Department of Land and Natural Resources, Division of Forestry and
14 Wildlife and they have expressed their support of the rule as well.

15
16 Vote: Approved, 7/0.

- 17 2. Request to: (1) Allow the Importation of Bottlenose Dolphin, *Tursiops truncatus*,
18 an Animal on the List of Restricted Animals (Part B), by Permit, for Scientific
19 Research by the U.S. Navy Marine Mammal Program, Spawar Systems Center
20 Pacific; and (2) Establish Permit Conditions for the Importation of Bottlenose
21 Dolphin, *Tursiops truncatus*, an Animal on the List of Restricted Animals (Part B),
22 by Permit, for Scientific Research by the U.S. Navy Marine Mammal Program,
23 Spawar Systems Center Pacific.
24

25 Presentation by Trenton Yasui, Plant Quarantine Branch (PQB) Acting Aquatics Specialist, as
26 submitted. At the start of his presentation, Acting Specialist Yasui telephoned the applicant, Dr.
27 Mark Zitco, who participated in the meeting long-distance on speaker phone from San Diego.

28 Acting Specialist Yasui said that Bottlenose dolphins are listed on the PQB's List of Restricted
29 Animals (Part B), which allows import for research by government agencies. The U.S. Navy's
30 Marine Mammal Program operated in Kaneohe Bay for years and then moved to San Diego.
31 The program has returned to Hawaii about every other year. The Navy employs dolphins
32 specialized in MK7 systems, a mine hunting system, to find and mark the location of underwater
33 objects. The dolphins are instrumental in clearing paths of safety for ships, troops, and
34 equipment movement. Dolphins are essential because their exceptional biological sonar
35 detection is superior to hardware sonar in detecting objects in the water and on the sea floor.
36

37 Acting Specialist Yasui said that, while in Hawaii, the dolphins will be housed in floating pens at
38 the Navy's mobile diving unit at Joint Base Pearl Harbor-Hickam. The dolphins will be
39 transported in boats to work in the open ocean. The Navy can identify and track the location of
40 each dolphin, as they will be wearing a harness with a tracking device and the harness has
41 satellite transmission to give the specific location of the dolphin.
42

43 Acting Specialist Yasui said that the Navy feels there is minimal potential for interaction with
44 humans, or other marine animals during operational periods. The dolphins' time spent in the
45 ocean is monitored by their trainers and when not training, the dolphins will be contained in the
46 floating enclosures.

1 PQB Acting Specialist Yasui said that there has been concern raised by the public about the
2 number of dolphins for import under the Navy's request and he clarified that the request is for 4
3 dolphins. The reference to 10 dolphins that some have noted in the Board's submittal is an
4 attachment of permit conditions for an old permit that was provided to the Board as background
5 information.

6
7 PQB Acting Specialist Yasui said that, when the Advisory Committee on Plants and Animals
8 reviewed the Navy's request, Advisory Committee member Robert Hauff asked about the
9 frequency of escapes and the potential for Navy dolphins to escape. At that time, the applicant,
10 Dr. Xitco, had responded that, during the history of the Navy's program there have been over
11 1,000,000 training session, there have only been a dozen escapes which occurred at the
12 inception of the program or were with wild dolphins.

13
14 Acting Specialist Yasui said that questions have also been raised about how long an import
15 permit would be valid. He said that, typically, the permit would be valid for as long as the
16 dolphins are in Hawaii, and the dolphins are expected to depart Hawaii on March 31. It is a
17 single shipment permit, so only one shipment of dolphins is allowed
18 Motion to take up staff's recommendation: Ha/Gallo.

19
20 Board member Ha asked about the number of dolphins being brought to Hawaii. Acting
21 Specialist Yasui said that the actual number of dolphins requested is 4.

22
23 Dr. Mark J. Xitco, Jr. of Joint Base Pearl Harbor Hawaii, on speaker phone from San Diego,
24 confirmed that the number of dolphins will be four. He said that additional animals beyond the
25 number needed are often put on the permit request, in the event that the primary animal is not
26 able to be transported in the time leading up to the trip and so a substitute can be used instead.

27
28 Board member Derrickson asked if the actual number of dolphins could be stated in the permit.
29 Mr. Yasui said that could be done.

30
31 Board member Derrickson asked if the permits were temporary and if a time limitation could be
32 put on the permit. Acting Specialist Yasui said that permits are usually for the life of the
33 organism. However, the applicant's intention is to have the dolphins depart Hawaii on March 31.

34
35 Dr. Xitco said that he was agreeable to putting a time limitation on the permit but that it was not
36 clear when the Navy would arrange the shipment. Acting Specialist Yasui proposed several
37 timeframes, including a 6 month timeframe, which Dr. Xitco said would be more than sufficient.
38 Acting Specialist Yasui said that a 6 month time frame from the date of importation would be
39 indicated in the permit.

40
41 Board member Hong asked what the natural range of the dolphins was and whether or not they
42 were found in Hawaiian waters.

43
44 Dr. Xitco said that the dolphins are found in temperate tropical waters all over the world and a
45 small number of them are also found around the Hawaiian islands.

46
47 Board member Galimba asked why this permit was coming before the Board if the previous
48 permits were approved by the Chairperson. PQB Acting Specialist Yasui said that the permit
49 conditions were being updated and so it was appropriate to bring the permit back before the
50 Board for approval.

1
2 Board member Galimba asked for an explanation as to why the dolphins were being brought to
3 Hawaii under a permit for scientific research and whether the project was more training or
4 research. PQB Acting Specialist Yasui said that it is PQB's view that data will be collected, and
5 scientific methods were going to be employed, which would fall in to the category of scientific
6 research.

7
8 Board member Derrickson asked if the Attorney General's Office was consulted in making the
9 determination that the activity fell within the category of scientific research. Acting Specialist
10 Yasui said that the Attorney General's Office was consulted and concurred with the decision.

11
12 Chairperson Enright invited public testimony.

13
14 Mr. Jim Anthony, private citizen, said that the military should have a physical presence at the
15 board meeting when they are making a request on a matter of such importance. He said that he
16 has spent 30 years protecting the environment and was disappointed that no one on the
17 Advisory Committee on Plants and Animals raised the issue of treatment of animals. He said
18 that the Government of India has granted dolphins personhood status and that no one has
19 asked the dolphins for their opinion. Mr. Anthony said that the staff submittal should not be
20 accepted by the Board and asked the Board to consider the moral implications of allowing
21 dolphins to be used in this type of program, regardless of whether the law allows it.

22
23 Ms. Mimi Foreyk, private citizen, said that she was opposed to the exploitation of any animal.

24
25 Ms. Cathy Goeggel of Animal Rights Hawaii said that she was particularly concerned about the
26 planned use of anti-foraging devices that can lead to starvation and dolphin death. She said
27 that she was also concerned about the drowning death of a staff employee involved with the
28 project. Ms. Goeggel said that she was opposed to granting the permit because there are
29 limited purposes for which dolphins should be brought in to Hawaii and that the permit
30 application says that the dolphins will be shipped aboard a military aircraft for military training
31 and that this is not on the list of approved uses. As military training is not on the list of approved
32 uses, she is requesting a contested case hearing.

33
34 Board member Galimba asked what the procedure was for a contested case hearing.

35
36 Chairperson Enright said that a contested case hearing request would be filed after a vote.

37
38 Board member Ornellas asked for clarification in regards to the difference between scientific
39 research and military research.

40
41 Deputy Attorney General Burns said that scientific research does not only occur in the
42 laboratory. Field research is also done. The type of knowledge that the Navy needs to gain can
43 only be obtained by bringing the dolphins to this particular terrain to gather data.

44
45 Board member Hong asked about the type of research that would be gained by this activity.

46
47 Dr. Xitco answered that the dolphins' performances would be measured following the trip and
48 their overt behaviors would be monitored, as well as their medical conditions after transport and
49 during the deployment. Daily activity will have the dolphins do various simulations with
50 simulated targets at various depths, with different topography, and at different times of day and

1 their performances would be evaluated for each condition. Data will be gathered for a report to
2 go back to Washington D.C.

3
4 Board member Derrickson asked whether a member of the public is allowed to request a
5 contested case hearing.

6
7 Deputy Attorney General Burns said that she didn't see a basis for it here, as she could see no
8 deprivation of interest that would entitle a person to request a contested case hearing.

9
10 Board member Gallo said that data can be collected, but that does not necessarily mean the
11 activity is scientific research. She said that she had some concerns that this activity was being
12 filed under scientific research and that she was unsure if the definition of scientific research in
13 the rules allowed for this permit.

14
15 PQB Acting Specialist Yasui said that the definition of scientific research is interpreted by PQB.

16
17 Board member Ha asked why dolphins were being used for this purpose.

18
19 Dr. Xitco responded that dolphins are the best at underwater detection and for a certain type of
20 mine, dolphins are the only method of detecting these mine threats.

21
22 Board member Galimba asked what the probability was of a dolphin being injured in detecting
23 mines.

24
25 Dr. Xitco said that there has never been an animal casualty in real operations. Mines have
26 accurate sensors, they are not designed to detonate when biological organisms are in the
27 vicinity, but instead are meant to destroy ships and other landing craft. He said that the long
28 term goal of the Navy is to replace the human and dolphin teams with drones. Safety could be
29 enhanced if underwater drones could be controlled at a greater distance.

30
31 Board member Galimba asked what the terms MK5, MK6, and MK8 meant.

32
33 Dr. Xitco said that the "MK" was shorthand for "mark" which is military jargon that is used to
34 classify all military grade weapons. These representations designate the various marine
35 mammal systems. Mark 5 is the group of California sea lions that are used to recover Navy
36 equipment in the deep ocean. This group is often used to clean up the practice mines that are
37 left after the Rim of the Pacific (RIMPAC) exercises. The Mark 6 group is a mix of dolphins and
38 sea lions used to protect harbors and Navy assets from swimmer and diver attacks. Mark 7 and
39 Mark 8 are dolphin mine hunting systems.

40
41 Mr. Anthony said that if the Board decided to approve this measure, he would make a formal
42 application for a contested case hearing.

43
44 Ms. Candace Whiting, private citizen, asked for more information about the anti-foraging device.

45
46 Dr. Xitco said that the anti-foraging device is a piece of equipment that all dolphins in the
47 program are trained to wear. It is a strap and bite plate that restricts how wide a dolphin can
48 open its mouth. When a dolphin wears it, it can only eat the food that the trainer provides but
49 not other larger indigenous fish. This is done to protect the dolphins from eating fish in the wild
50 that may carry toxins or pathogens. Large fresh fish in the wild haven't been checked by the

1 Navy as to parasites and toxins. The MK7 program deploys all over the world and there are
2 some fish that the Navy does not want the dolphins eating, for their own health and welfare.
3 The risk to the dolphins is limited by their wearing the anti-foraging device.
4

5 Ms. Whiting asked if this restricts the dolphins from opening their mouths and expressing certain
6 behavioral patterns, like threat behavior.
7

8 Dr. Xitco said that dolphins do open their mouths to express threat behavior. However, that
9 behavior is rare, as the dolphins are trained and the activities that they are doing requires
10 cooperation.
11

12 Vote: 5/2 with Board member Galimba and Gallo voting no. The motion failed for lack of the
13 required majority.
14

15 Recess called by the Chairperson at 10:27 AM
16 Reconvened at 10:32 AM

- 17 3. Request to Designate the Island of Oahu as an Expanded Coffee Berry Borer
18 Infested Area Subject to Quarantine Measures to Prevent the Movement of the
19 Coffee Berry Borer, Coffee Plants and Parts Thereof, Including Unroasted Seeds
20 (Green Coffee Beans), Used Coffee Bags, and Coffee Harvesting Equipment
21 Including Baskets, Sacks or Containers, Except by Permit Requiring Mitigative
22 Measures.
23

24 Presentation by PQB Entomologist Chris Kishimoto, as submitted. Mr. Kishimoto said that
25 Coffee Berry Borer (CBB), one of the most devastating pests of coffee was found in Kona,
26 Hawaii in 2010, and spread to Ka`u the following year. The Board of Agriculture designated
27 Hawaii island as CBB infested and, therefore, subject to quarantine restrictions on intrastate
28 transportation of coffee and other CBB hosts, first by interim rule in 2010 and then by
29 permanent rule in early 2012. In early December, 2014, CBB was discovered at Waialua, Oahu
30 and after it was confirmed to be established at Waialua Estates Coffee Farms and the Old
31 Waialua Sugar Mill, the Board designated these two sites as CBB infested areas subject to the
32 same quarantine restrictions to prevent CBB movement that applied to Hawaii island. In late
33 December, 2014, CBB was found at a private residence in Wahiawa and in January, 2015,
34 HDOA confirmed a CBB infestation at the University of Hawaii's Poamoho Research Station
35 near Wahiawa.
36

37 Mr. Kishimoto reviewed the status of statewide surveys for CBB on Oahu and the uninfested
38 neighbor islands. He explained that, in view of the ease with which CBB spreads and becomes
39 established, and the fact that Oahu is the crossroads for intrastate movement of coffee,
40 expanding the quarantine to island-wide quarantine for Oahu is necessary to prevent spread of
41 CBB to the uninfested neighbor islands.
42

43 Mr. Kishimoto said that there was a change in the submittal, as appendix B was removed.
44

45 Motion to take up staff's recommendation: Ornellas/Galimba.
46

47 Board member Derrickson asked what the process would be for shipments between islands that
48 are not infected, but that may have to transit through Oahu.
49

1 Mr. Kishimoto said that shipments from areas that are free of Coffee Berry Borer (CBB) do not
2 have to be treated. However, there is the fear that they could become infested while they are in
3 transit in Oahu, so PQB wants coffee from quarantine areas to be double-bagged to decrease
4 the risk of interaction with coffee from non-quarantine areas.
5

6 Amy Takahashi, Acting PQB Manager, said that at this point, the movement of coffee from a
7 non-quarantine area to another non-quarantine area is not addressed by the rules. However, if
8 the coffee being shipped is being altered on Oahu, then the permit conditions would take effect.
9 However, if the shipment is not being altered and is staying at the dock awaiting transit, then the
10 risk for infestation is minimal. This is due to the fact that coffee moving from infested areas is
11 being treated and double-bagged per permit conditions. The only possibility for cross infestation
12 would be commingling at the dock area.
13

14 Board member Derrickson asked if this situation should be addressed in rules.
15

16 Ms. Takahashi, said that it will be addressed in permit conditions, but PQB will look to amending
17 rules on this point.
18

19 Board member Ornellas asked if the quarantine of Oahu allows for the movement of equipment
20 and bags from Oahu to Kauai.
21

22 PQB's Mr. Kishimoto said that it would depend on where the equipment was moving from.
23 Currently, with the quarantine specific to the Waiialua area, equipment and bags cannot be
24 moved from that area. However, equipment and bags from other parts of the island would be
25 allowed to be moved currently.
26

27 Board member Hong asked how it would be possible for PQB to determine if the equipment
28 came from Waiialua or from other parts of the island.
29

30 Mr. Kishimoto said that they would not be able to confirm that information and hence the desire
31 for an island-wide quarantine of Oahu.
32

33 Chairperson Enright invited public testimony.
34

35 Mr. Jim Wayman, President of Hawaii Coffee Association, said that he supported moving the
36 boundaries for the quarantine area to include all of Oahu as the only prudent way to protect,
37 Molokai, Maui, and Kauai. He said that he wanted the quarantine to be expedited, to be done
38 as quickly as possible, as other islands are potentially exposed. He said that his experience
39 with importing from the Big Island that is currently under quarantine conditions is that the
40 process is workable, expensive but effective, and that the three methods in place to treat coffee
41 are not onerous.
42

43 Mr. Derek Lanter of Dole Waiialua Estate Coffee (Dole) said that he supported expanding the
44 quarantine area. However, he said that he had a number of concerns about how things have
45 been handled up to this point. He said that since the start of the quarantine of his orchard, he
46 has had significant challenges in selling his coffee and has been hampered by a lack of
47 understanding of the rules and inability to meet HDOA's requirements. He said that the current
48 quarantine on the Dole orchards and mills only, and not the roads connecting the two areas,
49 made it difficult to move coffee between the orchards and mills during harvest time, the busiest
50 time of the year. Mitigation requirements were possible through 3 methods: freezing, fumigation

1 or heat. Mr. Lanter said that, originally, he thought that freezing would be the most cost-
2 effective method, however, there was not enough information on the efficacy of freezing and so
3 it was not an option for the business. He said that fumigation became the only acceptable
4 method for the company. He said that, while a great deal of help has been put forward by PQB,
5 the business has not been able to satisfy the mitigation requirements in the two months since
6 the quarantine took effect in December. The problem that he sees is a lack of clear
7 understanding of how the permits work and the need for greater communication and industry
8 input. He said that Dole took all precautions when it found CBB on its premises by voluntarily
9 quarantining themselves until the quarantine rules could take effect. Mr. Lanter wanted to know
10 how the expanded quarantine would affect his business's ability to move coffee.
11

12 Mr. Wayne Katayama of Kauai Coffee said that since the discovery of CBB in Kona, three
13 actions were needed: detection program, reaction program and an ongoing treatment program.
14 He said that it is important that quarantine be put into effect quickly to limit the spread of CBB.
15 He said that a quick reaction plan is being developed through the cooperation of University of
16 Hawaii College of Tropical Agriculture and Human Resources, the Daniel K. Inouye Pacific
17 Basin Agricultural Research Center, and the United States Department of Agriculture. Mr.
18 Katayama said that, since the discovery of CBB, Kauai Coffee has taken action and has been
19 sampling for CBB in their coffee loads. So far, they have not found any CBB and they have
20 expanded their sampling efforts to every coffee load sent to the roasters. He said that Kauai
21 Coffee has been proactive in prevention, insuring that any coffee products or materials are
22 fumigated before being allowed on the farm. He said that public education is needed to
23 emphasize the potential negative impacts of the spread of CBB and the risk of cross
24 contamination. He said that he is in full support of an island wide quarantine of Oahu. He said
25 that he understands the industries who want to continue to do business, and he also supports
26 allowing growers to send coffee between islands following a science-based system.
27

28 Mr. Sean Steinman, a roaster in Kailua, Kona, said that he imports coffee from all over the State
29 and that he supports the quarantine expansion. He said that, with this new quarantine, he
30 wanted the movement of coffee between Kona and Oahu to be simpler because they would be
31 under the same quarantine restrictions.
32

33 Mr. Howard Green of Greenwell Farm on Oahu said that he is not impacted by the proposed
34 expanded quarantine, as he roasts all of their coffee on the premises and sells on the premises,
35 only. He said that, however, he does import either treated or roasted coffee from all over the
36 State and, so, he is concerned that there be continued requirements that all infested farms have
37 to treat their coffee to insure that it is safe. He wants to be able to bring in coffee safely. He
38 said he is happy to hear that Waialua Estates Coffee will treat their coffee on farm before
39 moving it.
40

41 Board member Ornellas asked if the island wide Oahu quarantine would help Waialua Estates
42 Coffee to continue doing business.
43

44 PQB Entomologist Mr. Kishimoto said that it would.
45

46 Board member Derrickson asked if freezing is an acceptable method for PQB.
47

48 Mr. Kishimoto said that freezing is an acceptable treatment to PQB and that the freezing method
49 was looked into by Waialua Estates Coffee and they deemed that it was not acceptable for
50 them.

1
2 Mr. Lanter said that while freezing is written down as an accepted method, Waialua Coffee
3 could not get the method approved by PQB. He said that the information did not seem to
4 indicate whether or not it would work and that there was a lack of information. He said that
5 there needs to be clarification and communication to roasters and growers as to how the permit
6 process works. He said that many in the industry are still confused about how the process is
7 supposed to work.

8
9 Chairperson Enright asked that Mr. Lanter stay after the meeting to have a further discussion
10 with staff about his concerns.

11
12 Vote: Approved, 7/0.

13
14 VI. COMMUNICATIONS FROM DIVISIONS AND ADMINISTRATION

15
16 VII. NEW BUSINESS

17
18 No new business.

19
20 VIII. ADJOURNMENT OF REGULAR MEETING

21
22 Motion to adjourn meeting: Gallo/Ha.

23 Meeting adjourned at 11:09 AM

24
25 Respectfully submitted,

26
27 

28
29 Ken H. Kakesako
30 Board Secretary