

1
2
3 **Minutes of the Board of Agriculture**
4
5



**Department
of Agriculture**
STATE OF HAWAII

6
7 **I. CALL TO ORDER**
8

9 The meeting of the Board of Agriculture was called to order on July 28, 2015 at 9:05
10 A.M. by Board of Agriculture Chairperson Scott Enright, at the Plant Quarantine
11 Conference Room, 1849 Auiki Street, Honolulu, Hawaii 96819.
12

13 **Members Present:**

14
15 Scott Enright, Chairperson, Board of Agriculture (Board)
16 Jerry Ornellas, Kauai Member
17 Mary Alice Evans, Department of Business, Economic Development and Tourism
18 (DBEDT), Ex Officio Member Designated Representative
19 Dr. Maria Gallo, Dean of the College of Tropical Agriculture & Human Resources
20 University of Hawaii (CTAHR-UH), Ex Officio Member
21 Glenn Hong, Member-At-Large
22 Michelle Galimba, Member-At-Large
23 Simon Russell, Maui Member
24 Clark Hashimoto, Member-At-Large
25 Suzanne Case, Chairperson, Board of Land and Natural Resources
26

27 **Members Absent:**

28
29 Richard Ha, Hawaii Member
30

31 **Others Present:**

32
33 Stacy Sugai, SK Natural Farms, LLC
34 Lorri Crockett, Empty the Tanks Hawaii
35 Josh Atwood, Hawaii Invasive Species Council
36 Randy Teruya, Agricultural Asset Manager, Hawaii Department of Agriculture
37 (HDOA) Agricultural Resource Management Division (ARMD)
38 Linda Murai, HDOA/ARMD
39 Joyce Wong, HDOA/ARMD
40 Randall Chang, HDOA/ARMD
41 Brian Neilson, Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR)/Division of
42 Aquatic Resources (DAR)
43 Brian Kanenaka, DLNR/DAR
44 Trenton Yasui, HDOA Plant Quarantine Branch (PQB)
45 Janelle Saneishi, HDOA Chairperson's Office (CHR)
46 Ken Kakesako, HDOA/ CHR

1	Amy Takahashi, HDOA/PQB Acting Manager	2
2	Andrew Goff, Deputy Attorney General	3
3	Hauani Burns, Deputy Attorney General	4
4	Delanie Prescott-Tate, Deputy Attorney General	5
5	Kevin Yokoyama, HDOA/Agricultural Loan Division	6
6	Samantha Rivera, Animal Rights Hawaii	7
7	Janelle Van Ruiten, Animal Rights Hawaii	8
8	Inga Gibson, Humane Society of the U.S.	9
9	Noe Kalipi, Kohala Institute (KI Fish Co.)	10
10	Cathy Goeggel, Animal Rights Hawaii	11
11	Jeri Kahana, HDOA/Quality Assurance Division (QAD) Administrator	12
12	Will Leon Guerrero, HDOA/PQB	13
13	Darcy Oishi, HDOA/Plant Pest Control Branch	14
14	Leonard Obaldo, HDOA/PQB	15
15	Lance Sakaino, HDOA/PQB	16
16	Kevin Minami, HDOA/PQB	17
17	Chris Kishimoto, HDOA/PQB	18
18	Patsy Oshiro, Oshiro Farm	19
19	Jonathan Ho, HDOA/PQB	20
20	Liz Xu, HDOA/Animal Industry Division	21
21	Isaac Maeda, HDOA/Animal Industry Division	22
22	Ken LeVasseur, Undersae Railroad	23
23	Raquel Wong, DVM, HDOA/Animal Quarantine Station	24
24	Bob Endreson, KI Fish Co.	25
25	Kent Dumiao, HDOA/PQ	26
26	David Niide, HDOA/PQ	27
27	Andrew Porter, Coordinating Group on Alien Pest Species	28
29	II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM JUNE 30, 2015 MEETING	30
31	Chairperson Enright called for a motion to approve the minutes from the Board's June 30, 2015 meeting.	32
33		34
34	Motion: Ornellas/Hashimoto.	35
35		36
36	Board Member Russell asked that on page 8 line 19 and 27 that "Dow" Pioneer be corrected to "Dupont" Pioneer.	37
38		39
39	Hearing no further comments, Chairperson Enright called for a vote to adopt the June 30, 2015 minutes as amended.	40
41		42
42	Vote: Approved, 9/0.	43
43		44
44	III. COMMENTS FROM THE GENERAL PUBLIC ON AGENDA ITEMS (ORAL OR WRITTEN)	45

1 Chairperson Enright stated that the Board will take public comments on the agenda
2 items as they come up during the meeting.

3

4 **IV. INTRODUCTION AND COMMENTS**

5

6 There were no introductions or comments.

7

8 **V. COMMUNICATIONS FROM DIVISIONS AND ADMINISTRATION**

9

10 **A. AGRICULTURAL LOAN DIVISION**

11

12 **1. Request for Approval of One (1) Direct Class A Loan to Stacy**
13 **H. K. Sugai and SK Natural Farms, LLC, co-borrowers.**

14

15 Presentation made by Kevin Yokoyama, Loan Officer, Agricultural Loan Division, as
16 submitted. The Direct Class A loan is for \$365,000 to refinance a first mortgage loan
17 and to repair an existing hog facility. Staff recommends approval.

18

19 Chairperson Enright called for a motion to entertain this request: Russell/Galimba.

20

21 Ms. Stacy Sugai presented testimony in support of the loan request. The current loan is
22 a variable mortgage through Finance Factors as they were the only agency that would
23 extend a loan to her. However, the loan was only for 60% of what the house was worth.
24 Some improvements to the facilities were made to include providing pens with regular
25 water. The safety and health of the pigs and workers will be the focus for the new
26 improvements.

27

28 Board Member Russell: Have you considered using the Korean natural farming
29 method?

30

31 Ms. Sugai: She wanted to use that method, but the costs to convert the facilities to
32 accommodate that method of farming were too costly. It would require either raising the
33 roof or digging out the existing cement pits. She tries to use natural farming methods.

34

35 Hearing no further comments, Chairperson Enright called for a vote on this loan
36 request.

37

38 Vote: Approved, 9/0.

39

40 **B. AGRICULTURAL RESOURCE MANAGEMENT DIVISION**

41

42 **1. Request for Consent to Assignment of General Lease**
43 **No. S-6021, Lot 21, for John Amphone, TMK: (1)**
44 **5-6-006:049, Kahuku Agricultural Park,**
45 **Koolauloa, Kahuku, Island of Oahu**

1 Presentation made by Randall Chang, Agricultural Resource Management Division
2 (ARM), as submitted. Staff recommends approval. The request is to add the lessee's
3 son's name to the lease. Both are bona fide farmers under HDOA's agricultural park
4 rules. The lease term is for 45 years at \$3,276.00 per year until the April 1, 2024 rent
5 reopening.

6
7 Chairperson Enright called for a motion to entertain this request: Hashimoto/Hong.

8
9 Hearing no further comments, Chairperson Enright called for a vote on this request.

10
11 Vote: Approved, 9/0.

12
13 **2. Request for Consent to Sublease Between the Hamakua**
14 **Agricultural Cooperative and Stanley Cypriano; Lot No. 24,**
15 **TMK 3rd Div/4-6-003:003 (por), Honokaia Makai Tract,**
16 **Hamakua, Island of Hawaii**

17
18 Presentation made by Joyce Wong, ARM, as submitted. Staff recommends approval.
19 The sublease term is until June 20, 2033 at \$1767.07 per year.

20
21 Chairperson Enright called for a motion to entertain this request: Galimba/Hashimoto.

22
23 Hearing no further comments, Chairperson Enright called for a vote on this request

24
25 Vote: Approved, 9/0.

26
27 **3. Request for Extension of General Lease No. S-4446,**
28 **Lot No. 18, TMK 3rd Div/2-4-049:002, H. Eunice**
29 **Nursery, Inc., Panaewa Farm Lots, 2nd Series,**
30 **Waiakea, So. Hilo, Island of Hawaii**

31
32 Presentation by Joyce Wong, ARM, as submitted. Staff recommends approval. The
33 lease extension was for 10 years ending on September 30, 2020 at \$4,000 per year.

34
35 Chairperson Enright called for a motion to entertain this request: Evans/Gallo.

36
37 Board Member Russell: What is the difference in rental rates between this request and
38 the previous request, which was also on Hawaii Island?

39
40 Ms. Wong: The differences are attributed to location; one lot is in the city, Hilo, and the
41 other lot is in the country, Panaewa.

42
43 Board Member Galimba: How is the extension period determined?

44
45 Ms. Wong: Length of extension is primarily based on the request from the lessee. The
request is then reviewed by ARM to determine if the request is appropriate.

1 Board Member Hong: Will the rent change in 2020 and 2030?

2
3 Ms. Wong: The rent will change in line with the lease reappraisals that will be done at
4 that time.

5
6 Hearing no further comments, Chairperson Enright called for a vote on this request.

7
8 Vote: Approved, 9/0.

9
10 **4. Request for Extension of General Lease No. S-4638,**
11 **Lot No. 25, TMK: 3rd Div/2-4-049:009, Big Island**
12 **Plant & Foliage, Panaewa Farm Lots, 2nd Series,**
13 **Waiakea, So. Hilo, Island of Hawaii**

14
15 Presentation made by Joyce Wong, ARMD, as submitted. Staff recommends approval.
16 The lease extension is for 30 years to 2045 at \$4,380 per year until the next rent
17 reopenings at 10 and 20 years.

18
19 Chairperson Enright called for a motion to entertain this request: Galimba/Ornellas.

20
21 Hearing no further comments, Chairperson Enright called for a vote on this request

22
23 Vote: Approved, 9/0.

24
25 Chairperson Enright called for a recess at 9:21 AM.

26 Meeting reconvened at 9:25 AM.

27
28 **C. PLANT INDUSTRY DIVISION**

29
30 **Plant and Non-Domestic Animal Quarantine**
31 **Invertebrate and Aquatic Biota**

- 32
33 **1. Request to: (1) Approve the Transfer of Possession of a Bottlenose**
34 **Dolphin, *Tursiops truncatus*, an Animal on the List of Restricted**
35 **Animals (Part B), by Permit, from Dolphin Quest Oahu, Inc. in**
36 **Honolulu, to Dolphin Quest, Inc., Waikoloa, Island of Hawaii, for**
37 **Commercial Use; and (2) Update Permit Conditions for the**
38 **Possession of Bottlenose Dolphin, *Tursiops truncatus*, an Animal**
39 **on the List of Restricted Animals (Part B), for Commercial Use by**
40 **Dolphin Quest, Inc., Waikoloa, Island of Hawaii.**

41
42 Presentation made by David Niide, HDOA/PQB, as submitted. Mr. Niide noted that the
43 format of the submittals to the Board was recently changed due to concerns raised at
44 the Advisory Committee on Plants and Animals meeting. To avoid giving the
45 impression that the permit application information contained in the submittal was drafted

1 by PQB, or that PQB in any way endorsed the application, the format of the submittals
2 has been changed to clearly differentiate what information was provided by the
3 applicant and what information was provided by PQB and its technical consultants. Mr.
4 Nilde stated that, according to Dolphin Quest's application, the dolphins to be
5 transferred will have no contact with wild dolphins, that fences have been constructed to
6 prevent contact with humans and marine life, and that the transfer will have no impact
7 on the environment. Mr. Nilde explained that, due to miscommunication, the applicants
8 were not present at this Board meeting. The Advisory Committee on Plants and
9 Animals unanimously (5/0) recommended approval of this request
10
11 Chairperson Enright called for a motion to entertain this request.: Evans/Hashimoto.
12
13 The Board received a written statement from Laura Russell, General Manager of
14 Dolphin Quest, in support of the request, and also received written testimony in
15 opposition to the request from Inga Gibson, Humane Society of the United States, and
16 from Tim Dow.
17
18 Chairperson Enright invited the public to testify on this agenda item.
19
20 Ms. Inga Gibson, Humane Society of the U.S.: Ms. Gibson presented testimony in
21 opposition to this permit request. Ms. Gibson presented the Board with her testimony in
22 opposition to this permit request. She stated that Dolphin Quest, Inc. (DQI) was cited
23 January 21, 2015 by the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) for having
24 inadequacies in their dolphin pool facility that could have put the dolphins at risk. She
25 said that the citation stipulated that DQI had until July 1, 2015 to address those
26 deficiencies. She does not know if those concerns have been corrected. She said that
27 the permit history was not clear as to who owns the dolphins and that USDA had
28 cancelled a permit. DQI's Oahu facilities have not been inspected by USDA since
29 January 2014. This violation history was not shared with the advisory subcommittee.
30 Ms. Gibson also stated that this transfer was being done for breeding purposes and she
31 had concerns about what effect increasing the dolphin population will have on dolphins
32 already at DQI. She also expressed concern about how the dolphins were to be
33 transferred. She asked that the permit be withheld until the facilities could be inspected.
34
35 Board Member Case: In your opinion is the transfer of the dolphins being done in a
36 manner that meets with best practices for the humane treatment of animals?
37
38 Ms. Gibson: She was not familiar with the best practices for the humane treatment of
39 dolphins. She did not think the standards set by the Alliance of Marine Mammal Parks
40 and Aquariums (AMMPA) was adequate as they are a business group and not a
41 medical group.
42
43 Board Member Russell: Is there a difference in the life span of dolphins in the wild
44 versus those in captivity?
45

1 Mr. Niide: He did not know.
2

3 Ms. Cathy Goeggel, Animal Rights Hawaii: Presented testimony in opposition to this
4 permit request. She was pleased with the changes made to the format of PQB
5 submittals. She claimed that PQB staff sent her an email asking permission to give her
6 contact information to DQI. Ms. Goeggel did not think it was appropriate for PQB staff
7 to serve as an intermediary between DQI and herself. Ms. Goeggel's position is the
8 dolphins are captives, not voluntary participants in DQI's programs. She would like
9 further clarification from DQI regarding some of the statements in their application.
10

11 Mr. Ken LeVasseur, Undersea Railroad: Presented testimony in opposition to this
12 permit request. The Undersea Railroad was declared a terrorist organization in 1977.
13 Information about the life span and deaths of animals in captivity are skewed and
14 withheld from animal rights groups. Transportation mortalities are much higher for
15 captive animals and that mortality occurring within two days of transport was reported
16 as occurring at the facility. He thought the information in the DQI permit application was
17 propaganda and that, in terms of legal concepts, the dolphins are not "voluntary
18 ambassadors", but "persons" in the slave trade.
19

20 Board Member Case: Obviously, DQI's operation is allowed by law. She reminded
21 the public not to approach wild dolphins when they are near shore, as they need to rest
22 and approaching them could cause a person harm.
23

24 Board Member Galimba: In view of Ms. Gibson's testimony about the USDA violations,
25 what are the updates to the permit conditions?
26

27 Mr. Jonathan Ho, HDOA/PQB: The proposed new conditions are on pages C-16
28 through C-18 of the submittal. PQB will work with USDA staffer Caroline McKinney to
29 insure that the DQI facilities are in compliance with USDA requirements prior to any
30 transportation of dolphins between the facilities. Even if the Board approved the
31 transfer, PQB would not allow the transport to take place if there were any outstanding
32 violations.
33

34 Board Member Case: Are the conditions beginning on page C-16 of the submittal
35 permit conditions the staff felt were best practices?
36

37 Mr. Ho: Yes.
38

39 Board Member Hashimoto: It would be better to have DQI in attendance to address the
40 questions and concerns being posed.
41

42 Board Member Hong: Has DQI taken any steps to repair or improve the facilities?
43

44 Mr. Niide: He did not know.
45

1 Board Member Russell: In 2002, Maui County banned the display of any captive whale
2 or dolphin.

3
4 Chairperson Enright deferred this agenda item until the August meeting to give DQI an
5 opportunity to attend and answer the questions raised.

6
7 **2. Request to: (1) Approve the Transfer of Possession of Two (2)**
8 **Bottlenose Dolphins, *Tursiops truncatus*, an Animal on the List of**
9 **Restricted Animals (Part B), by Permit, from Dolphin Quest, Inc.,**
10 **Waikoloa, Island of Hawaii, to Dolphin Quest Oahu, Inc., in Honolulu,**
11 **for Commercial Use; and (2) Update Permit Conditions for the**
12 **Possession of Bottlenose Dolphin, *Tursiops truncatus*, an Animal**
13 **on the List of Restricted Animals (Part B), for Commercial Use by**
14 **Dolphin Quest Oahu, Inc., in Honolulu.**

15
16 Chairperson Enright also deferred this agenda item until the August meeting to give DQI
17 an opportunity to attend and answer the questions raised.

18
19 Chairperson Enright called for a recess at 9:54 A.M.
20 Meeting reconvened at 9:59 A.M.

21
22 Plant Quarantine

23
24 **1. Plant Quarantine Branch Background Report on Ohia Rapid Death**
25 **(aka Ohia Wilt) Caused by a Fungus, *Ceratocystis fimbriata*, found on**
26 **the Island of Hawaii.**

27
28 Presentation made by Wil Leon Guerrero, HDQA/PQB and Mr. Jonathan Ho,
29 HDQA/PQB. Mr. Guerrero informed the Board that a fungus known as Ohia Wilt is
30 killing Ohia trees. The fungus kills the trees by clogging up their vascular system.
31 While the fungus that causes this is known, the actual strain is not. Ohia Wilt has been
32 found in Puna, the lower sections of the Hilo forest reserve, and Saddle Road. The
33 fungus can survive long periods of time and has been found on soil, grass, and insects
34 that feed on Ohia trees. There are concerns of potential spreading of the virus by
35 landscapers and those who were helping to clean up debris following recent storms.
36 Cutting tools and vehicles, and the clothing that people wore while working in the area
37 could all be vectors that could transport the fungus to uninfested areas. The
38 assumption is that the fungus infects plants by entering at points where the plant is
39 injured. It is not known so far if the Ohia Wilt is on the other islands but continued
40 monitoring is being done.

41
42 Board Member Hashimoto: How widespread is the virus?
43

1 Mr. Guerrero: The virus is in Puna and Hilo. They suspect that the fungus is spreading.
2 An aerial assessment is being done. More information will be forthcoming following a
3 meeting of the stakeholders on July 30, 2015.
4

5 Board Member Russell: He has had some success spraying beneficial microorganisms
6 on his crops when they have a fungus.

7 Board Member Ornellas: Can other ornamental plants host the fungus?
8

9 Mr. Guerrero: We don't know, but testing is ongoing.
10

11 Mr. Ho: When the fungus was first discovered in 2009 or 2010, it had infected an area
12 of about 1000 acres. He believes that now it has infected about 5000 or 6000 acres.
13

14 Mr. Guerrero: HDOA is working with a Pathologist from USDA Agricultural Research
15 Services, Dr. Lisa Keith. They are also working with JB Keith at the University of Hawaii
16 College of Tropical Agriculture and Human Resources (CTAHR) and Flint Hughes of the
17 US Forest Service.
18

19 Board Member Ornellas: Is the pathogen related to the rosy apple pathogen?
20

21 Mr. Guerrero: No.
22

23 Mr. Ho: The virus has a wide host range and people have been aware of it existing in
24 Hawaii since the 1940's. However this strain is different.
25

26 Board Member Case: Has a master plan been created to coordinate the response to
27 deal with this infection?
28

29 Mr. Guerrero: PQB is working with the US Forest Service and the USDA. Pathology is
30 being handled by the USDA with CTAHR doing the educational outreach. PQB is the
31 conduit for submitting samples and controlling the spread of the disease, however
32 everyone's specific roles are still being worked out. There is particular concern about
33 the watershed should there be major dieback.
34

35 Board Member Evans: Is the virus only affecting one species of Ohia? If it is, is that
36 one species on all of the islands?
37

38 Mr. Guerrero: There are five species of Ohia. The virus is only affecting one species.
39 That species is on all of the major islands.
40

41 Board Member Russell: Hawaii Island is a big exporter of Ohia logs. Is this a concern
42 at the harbors?
43

44 Mr. Guerrero: Ohia logs are a major concern. US Forest Service and CTAHR are
45 working on that.

1 Board Member Ornellas: Is implementing a quarantine being considered?
2
3
4 Mr. Guerrero: More information is needed before a quarantine is implemented but that
5 is under consideration.
6
7 Board Member Case: Should Ohia logs be inspected?
8
9 Mr. Guerrero: Inspection of logs is being considered.
10
11 Board Member Galimba: PQB should move quickly in its deliberations.
12
13 Board Member Case: Are Ohia branches being used in the floral industry?
14
15 Mr. Guerrero: They are used for lei making and for cultural practices. Dr. Keith of the
16 USDA believes that foliage is a low risk. The real risk is people who enter the forest.
17 They could become carriers of the virus.
18
19 Chairperson Enright: It is expected that the Board will see a request for a quarantine of
20 Ohia on Hawaii Island at the next board meeting. Since early June, PQB has been in
21 discussion with USDA and the US Forest Service.
22
23 Board Member Hong: Do logs being shipped out of Hawaii Island require an agricultural
24 inspection? When Little Fire Ant was found on hapuu logs being shipped between the
25 islands, Young Brothers made a business decision to require an inspection from PQB.
26 Young Brothers would be willing to do that again in regards to Ohia if that was a
27 recommendation from PQB.
28
29 Board Member Evans: Is there a way to do a visual inspection to determine if a tree is
30 infected?
31
32 Mr. Ho: When a log is cut there will be a black ring if it is infected. It is not possible at
33 this time to tell from visually inspecting a tree if it is infected. A tree that looks healthy
34 could be infected and die within a three week period.
35
36 Mr. Guerrero: The virus could also be carried in soil that is on a tree being transported.
37 If a tree is transplanted and injured it can provide an opportunity for the virus to infect it.
38
39 Hearing no further comments, Chairperson Enright stated that the Ohia Willt issue will
40 be addressed at the next Board meeting.
41
42
43
44
45

VI. OLD BUSINESS

1. Resubmittal of Request to: (1) Allow the Importation of Asian Sea Bass, *Lates calcarifer*, an Animal on the List of Restricted Animals

1 **(Part B), by Permit, for Aquaculture in Above Ground Tanks, by KI Fish**
2 **Company, LLC.; and (2) Establish Permit Conditions for the**
3 **Importation of Asian Sea Bass, *Lates calcarifer*, an Animal on the List**
4 **of Restricted Animals (Part B), by Permit, for Aquaculture in Above**
5 **Ground Tanks, by KI Fish Company, LLC. (Deferred from June 30,**
6 **2015 Board of Agriculture Meeting)**
7

8 Presentation made by David Niide, HDOA/PQB, as submitted. This is a resubmittal with
9 minutes attached from the May 18, 2015 Advisory Committee on Plants and Animals
10 meeting, Kohala Institute's (KI) application addendum, and testimony from Ron
11 Weidenbach of Hawaii Fish Co. The Advisory Committee on Plants and Animals
12 recommended that the permit request be denied (7/0, 1 abstention). At the time of the
13 Advisory Committee on Plants and Animals meeting, no site inspection of the
14 applicant's facility had been done. Since then a PQB site inspection has been
15 completed. As a result of this inspection, PQB believes that KI's facility is biosecure.
16 The security features KI has in-place indicates KI's commitment to prevent fish
17 escapement. However, since PQB bases its recommendations on the
18 recommendations of the advisory subcommittee and the Advisory Committee on Plants
19 and Animals, PQB does not recommend approval of the permit application.
20

21 Chairperson Enright called for a motion to entertain this request: Gallo/Russell.
22

23 The Board received written testimony in support of the request from Board member
24 Richard Ha and written testimony in opposition to the request from Alton Miyasaka,
25 Acting Administrator of Department of Land and Natural Resources, Division of Aquatic
26 Resources, and from Christy Martin, the Coordinating Group on Alien Pest Species.
27

28 Chairperson Enright invited the public to testify on this agenda item.
29

30 Mr. Brian Neilson, Department of Land and Natural Resources, Division of Aquatic
31 Resources (DAR): Presented testimony in opposition to this permit request. The
32 reason for their opposition was due to the risk of escape or establishment of the
33 species. It is difficult to safeguard against the accidental release of fish given the high
34 number of employees and high desirability of the species. This fish species has a high
35 salinity tolerance and could establish itself in estuaries and near shore environments
36 and could compete with native species. The fish poses too big of a risk to the economy
37 and environment.
38

39 Mr. Josh Atwood, Hawaii Invasive Species Council: Presented testimony in opposition
40 to this permit request. In spite of the PQB site visit, he believes it is difficult to
41 guarantee with 100% certainty that the fish would not escape. The risks to the
42 environment are too high and outweigh the benefits. Human error is always a factor.
43 He believes that it is not financially possible for KI Fish Co. to post a bond to mitigate
44 possible escape.
45

1 Chairperson Enright: Can you envision a biosecure facility that would allow KI Fish Co.
2 to do business?
3
4 Mr. Atwood: He is not an expert, but that the species does pose a high invasive species
5 risk.
6
7 Board Member Evans: Is Asian sea bass being raised in Hawaii for commercial
8 purposes, and if so, was it approved for import at some point?
9
10 Mr. Ho: Asian sea bass is being raised and sold here only for fish fillet. When the
11 company was given approval to have Asian sea bass, they had two to three years of
12 experience with other fish species at their facility. No other approval for importation of
13 Asian sea bass has been given since 1999.
14
15 Board Member Evans: Is the applicant's facility similar to the company on the north
16 shore of Oahu? Are the risk factors of concern the physical facilities or the human error
17 factor that results from raising such an economically attractive fish species?
18
19 Mr. Ho: The applicant's facilities are different from the north shore Oahu permittees'
20 facility. The applicant is using above ground tanks. There was concern about the
21 applicant's desire to raise and distribute the fish rather than only sell fish fillets like the
22 north shore Oahu operation.
23
24 Board Member Case: Can PQB's position on the application be clarified?
25
26 Mr. Ho: PQB relies on the technical expertise of the advisory subcommittee members.
27 One member of the advisory subcommittee recommended approval, but the others
28 recommended disapproval. The Advisory Committee on Plants and Animals also
29 recommended disapproval. Therefore, PQB is recommending disapproval.
30
31 Chairperson Enright: When the applicant presented the permit request to the advisory
32 subcommittee and the Advisory Committee on Plants and Animals the focus was not
33 the biosecurity of the site, but on the economics of the endeavor. He has visited the
34 site. Board Member Ha has visited the site. Had the biosecurity plans been presented
35 to the reviewing committees, their concerns could have been better addressed.
36
37 Mr. Bob Endreson, KI Fish Co.: Presented testimony in support of this permit request.
38 The facility was designed with so much redundancy that, even if all the tanks failed, no
39 fish would escape. If needed, water would be discharged to the pasture and not to the
40 ocean at all. KI Fish Co.'s facility is two miles from the ocean, landlocked, and has no
41 discharge into water. Why are the biosecurity measures acceptable for another fish
42 species (tilapia) but not for this species? If a site visit was done before the Advisory
43 Committee meeting then the recommendation would have been different.
44

1 Chairperson Enright: There was a concern raised regarding the number of employees
2 at the facility and how to control the movement of the fish stock?
3

4 Mr. Endreson: There are six employees in direct contact with the fish. Forty or forty-
5 five employees, including those employees, will be at the processing facility dealing with
6 the fish after they're dead. The facility itself is gated and direct contact with the fish is
7 controlled to reduce the likelihood of introducing new diseases to the fish.
8

9 Ms. Noe Kalipi, KI Fish Co. President: They are willing to address the concern about
10 employee theft by agreeing to permit conditions that require employees to be inspected
11 prior to leaving the facility. Not all relevant information was provided to the reviewing
12 committees. This could have affected their final recommendations.
13

14 Board Member Case: She appreciates the applicant's strong attention to detail in
15 regards to the biosecurity aspect of the facility. Aquaculture is important, but it must be
16 done in a way that minimizes the risks to Hawaii's environment. This includes the
17 choice of fish species to bring in. There is a high level of predictability, notwithstanding
18 biosecurity measures, that it would only be a matter of time before this fish would get
19 out in the wild. The qualities that are looked at for this fish's success in aquaculture are
20 also one of its dangers. These adult fish can survive in salt water. She would support
21 efforts to do aquaculture with a species that had a lower risk of invasiveness.
22

23 Board Member Evans: Is Asian sea bass a fresh or brackish water fish?
24

25 Mr. Endreson: Asian sea bass grows in fresh water but spawns in brackish water and
26 would survive in saltwater. Its native range is Asia and Australia. There is no 100%
27 secure biosecurity facility anywhere.
28

29 Board Member Hashimoto: Did anyone inspect the site prior to the advisory
30 subcommittee or committee hearings?
31

32 Mr. Niide: No.
33

34 Mr. Ho: PQB staff went to visit the applicant's site but did not conduct an inspection as
35 the facility was not completed at that time. Information submitted from the applicant to
36 the advisory subcommittee has been piecemeal. The subcommittee has not reviewed
37 the applicant's latest addendum (Attachment B).
38

39 Board Member Hong: Shares the concerns of other Board members that the
40 subcommittee and committee members lacked sufficient information.
41

42 Board Member Gallo: She is unhappy with the process. The committees should have
43 all appropriate information in order to make a sound decision.
44

45 Board Member Case: Her concern is not the facility but the choice of species.

1 Board Member Gallo: It might be best if the process was restarted to allow the
2 subcommittee and committee to review all of the information at hand.
3
4 Board Member Russell: Supports Board Member Gallo's comments and shares Board
5 Member Case's concern about the invasive nature of the choice of species. He is
6 supportive of allowing the subcommittee to have a second look at all the information.
7
8 Board Member Galimba: Shares the concerns raised by Board Member Case. She
9 cannot support the application at this time.
10
11 Chairperson Enright: He wants to promote aquaculture. But he is also charged with
12 protecting the environment. He suggests sending the application back to the
13 committees to review again; this time with all the information. It is clear the Board is not
14 willing to go against the recommendation of the advisory committees.
15
16 Mr. Endreson: He does not understand why the board would approve the application so
17 for import but not Asian sea bass. He asked the Board to disapprove the application so
18 that he could request a contested case hearing.
19
20 Chairperson Enright: There has been a lot of confusion with this application. The
21 subcommittees did not have a chance to review all of the information regarding
22 biosecurity of the proposed facility before making their recommendation. The
23 subcommittee should be given the opportunity to take a second look at the application.
24
25 Ms. Amy Takahashi, Acting PQB Manager: She believes that even with the additional
26 information the committees will not change their recommendations. The concern is the
27 possibility of this fish's escape. She suggested that the application be amended to
28 allow the importation of the species for a specific phase of the project and eliminate the
29 breeding phase due to the greater risks involved.
30
31 Ms. Kalipi: Asked that, if modification of the application was being considered, some
32 fish be allowed in now to help defray the economic burden of running the facility.
33
34 Ms. Takahashi: Any modification of the application would need to go back to the
35 subcommittee and advisory committee for a recommendation.
36
37 Chairperson Enright: Asked the staff to assist with modification of the permit application
38 and then send the modified application to the subcommittee and advisory committee for
39 review.
40
41 Board Member Russell: Is KI Fish Co. growing any other fish varieties that were
42 potentially invasive?
43
44

1 Ms. Kalipi: No. They were only growing the fish up to 2 pounds before they are killed.
2 Right now, the facility is not producing anything. The initial target fish was the Niloticus
3 species, which is pending rule change. Due to the delay of approval for Niloticus, KI
4 has been looking for other potential species to raise.

5

6 Board Member Case: Is there any way to import sterile fry for grow out?

7

8 Mr. Ho: Is there a way to force Asian sea bass to be only male?

9

10 Ms. Kalipi: Not sure about Asian sea bass, but it is possible with Niloticus.

11

12 Board Member Ornellas: According to prior testimony by Mr. Ron Weidenbach, Asian
13 sea bass is a difficult fish to raise profitably. The risks involved with this species of fish
14 outweigh the benefits.

15

16 Ms. Liz Xu: HDOA Aquaculture Development Program: There are successful
17 operations around the United States that are raising Asian sea bass. It could be an
18 economic driver for Hawaii.

19

20 Board Member Ornellas: If the project is successful, then other farms may want to take
21 part in it.

22

23 Ms. Kalipi: A high standard for biosecure facilities would need to be met before that
24 could happen.

25

26 Chairperson Enright: The application will be sent back to the subcommittee and Plant
27 and Animal Advisory Committee for review.

28

29 **VII. NEW BUSINESS**

30

31 There was no new business.

32

33 **VIII. ADJOURNMENT OF REGULAR MEETING**

34

35 Having no further business before the Board, Chairperson Enright called for a motion to
36 adjourn meeting: Galimba/Hashimoto.

37

38 Meeting adjourned at 11:08 AM

39

40 Respectfully submitted,

41

42 

44 Ken H. Kakesako

45 Board Secretary

