

**Minutes of the Advisory Committee on Plants and Animals**  
**March 6, 2019 Meeting**  
Hawaii Department of Agriculture (HDOA)

I. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting of the Advisory Committee on Plants and Animals was called to order by Advisory Committee Chairperson Dr. Kevin Hoffman on Wednesday, March 6, 2019 at 1:38 P.M. at the Plant Quarantine Branch Conference Room, 1849 Auiki Street, Honolulu, Hawaii 96819.

Members Present:

Dr. Kevin M. Hoffman, Committee Chairperson, Hawaii Department of Agriculture  
Kenneth Matsui, Petland/Pets Pacifica Ex Officio Member Designated Representative  
Dr. Benton Pang, Invasive Species Team Manager, U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service  
Dr. Sarah Park, State Epidemiologist, Department of Health  
Kenneth Redman, Retired Director of the Honolulu Zoo  
Brian Neilson, Division of Aquatic Resources, Department of Land & Natural Resources (DLNR), Ex Officio Member Designated Representative

Members Absent:

Scott Glenn, Director, Office of Environmental Quality Control, Ex Officio Member  
Dr. Maria Haws, Director, Pacific Aquaculture & Coastal Research Center, University of Hawaii at Hilo  
Robert Hauff, Department of Land and Natural Resources (DLNR)

Others Present:

Jennifer Waihee-Polk, Deputy Attorney General  
Jonathan Ho, Acting Branch Manager, Plant Quarantine Branch (PQB)  
Trenton Yasui, PQB Acting Inspection & Compliance Chief  
Techie Lancaster, PQB Acting Invertebrate & Aquatic Biota Specialist  
David Lingenfelter, PQB Acting Land Vertebrate Specialist  
Chris Kishimoto, PQB Entomologist Specialist  
Karen Hiroshige, PQB Secretary  
Leo Obaldo, Economic Development Specialist, Hawaii Department of Agriculture  
Liz Xu, Economic Development Specialist, Hawaii Department of Agriculture  
Thee See Ba, Owner, Alii Agriculture Farm, LLC.

II. INTRODUCTION AND COMMENTS

Chairperson Kevin Hoffman and the Advisory Committee members introduced themselves.

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE FEBRUARY 12, 2019 MEETING

Chairperson Hoffman asked the Committee to review the minutes for the February 12, 2019 meeting before fielding a motion to approve them.

Chairperson Hoffman inquired regarding the need for discussion, Committee member Ken Redman moved to approve the minutes of the February 12, 2019 meeting. The motion to approve was seconded by Advisory Committee member Kevin Hoffman and was passed unanimously.

Vote: APPROVED 6/0.

IV. COMMENTS FROM GENERAL PUBLIC ON AGENDA ITEMS (ORAL OR WRITTEN)

Chairperson Hoffman asked if there were any comments from the general public on any of the agenda items. There were no comments from the general public.

V. REQUESTS TO BE REVIEWED BY THE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Invertebrate and Aquatic Biota:

Request to: (1) Allow the Importation of Nile Tilapia, *Oreochromis niloticus*, a Fish on the List of Restricted Animals (Part B), by Permit, for Aquaculture Production, by Kohala Mountain Fish Company, LLC; and (2) Establish Permit Conditions for the Importation of Nile Tilapia, *Oreochromis niloticus*, a Fish on the List of Restricted Animals (Part B), by Permit, for Aquaculture Production, by Kohala Mountain Fish Company, LLC.

Advisory Committee member, Mr. Kenneth Matsui, asked the applicant, Mr. John Oliva, if the YY Supermale he plans to import were to reproduce, would it always produce male progeny. Mr. Oliva said that as long as the YY Supermale are bred with normal phenotypical female, they will produce males. Advisory Committee member Matsui also asked if the YY Supermale is a YY diploid and not a triploid. Mr. Oliva confirmed that the YY Supermale is a YY diploid and explained that the YY Supermale is made via genetic crosses and no hormones are used, and that temperature change is

## HDOA Advisory Committee Minutes – March 6, 2019

used to change the male tilapia to female whereby high water temperatures produce males and low temperatures produce females.

Advisory Committee member, Brian Neilson, asked Mr. Oliva if his plan is to create a hatchery where the company can produce its own juvenile fish to supply operations or if they plan to continually import. Mr. Oliva confirmed that he plans to create a hatchery so that he doesn't have to rely on imports.

Advisory Committee member Neilson asked what the rationale is behind the reliance on male-only fish. Mr. Oliva said that the reason is because the males grow faster and larger than females, require less time to reach market size, and reduce the likelihood of unwanted spawning that will slow production. Advisory Committee member Matsui asked what the grow-out time for *O. mossambicus* is as compared to *O. niloticus*. Mr. Oliva said that the grow-out time for *O. mossambicus* is 9-10 months, and *O. niloticus* is 6-8 months, depending on water temperature.

Advisory Committee member, Kenneth Redman, noted that Advisory Subcommittee member, Mr. Justin Goggins, recommended disapproval of his request because *O. niloticus* is an invasive species, causes habitat degradation and so forth, and asked for Mr. Oliva's response to Mr. Goggin's assessment. In response, Mr. Oliva said that *O. niloticus* is distributed world-wide, it is established in Hawaii because of the University of Hawaii, it could be invasive, but it is the least invasive tilapia that is already present in Hawaii and easiest to manage, it is not tolerant of pure sea water or brackish water, and that its eating habits are different than that of *O. mossambicus* and bottom feeders.

Advisory Committee member Redman said that Mr. Oliva's take on the subject is that it is not harmful to import *O. niloticus*, and asked Mr. Oliva if that is the correct assessment. Mr. Oliva said that he does not contend that *O. niloticus* is not harmful in the environment. He stated that *O. niloticus* is already here, that the YY Supermale they plan to import will have the least chance to produce, that they will produce all-male stock, and if these fish were to escape, it will not get massive.

Advisory Committee Chairperson, Dr. Kevin Hoffman, asked if the Nile tilapia is known to be on the island of Hawaii. Mr. Oliva said that the University of Hawaii at Hilo has it and is selling it to stores. Chairperson Hoffman asked Mr. Oliva if he thinks it is present in the natural environment or only being farmed. Mr. Oliva responded that there was a genetic study that found Nile tilapia in the Wailuku Rivers, and pure and hybridized populations were found in a few other places.

Advisory Committee member, Dr. Benton Pang, said that according to the request, importation would be only through Honolulu, and asked Mr. Oliva how that will be enforced and how they can ensure that it won't enter into the state through another port. Mr. Oliva said that the shipment will be from Thailand, so it will be cleared by customs in Honolulu, and then get flown to Kona. Acting PQB Inspection and Compliance Section Chief Mr. Trenton Yasui stated at a later point in the meeting that

the Hawaii Board of Agriculture designated the approved port of entry for regulated commodities, and the approved port of entry for Nile tilapia would be Honolulu. Advisory Committee member Pang asked if the fish are quarantined in Honolulu or Hawaii Island. Mr. Oliva said it is quarantined at the Kohala facility on Hawaii island.

Advisory Committee member Pang referenced Advisory Subcommittee member, Dr. Lei Yamasaki's comment that she does not support importation from Thailand, and asked Mr. Oliva if there is another source for Nile tilapia other than Thailand. Mr. Oliva replied that the YY will come from Til-Aqua in Netherland, and that the Mozambique tilapia will come from Thailand. Advisory Committee member Pang asked if it is possible for Mr. Oliva to import the Mozambique tilapia from a country other than Thailand due to the risk of importing disease from that country. Mr. Oliva said that Thailand is the only place that he has found that is producing sufficient numbers of Mozambique tilapia because most other producers have switched over to producing Nile tilapia. Mr. Oliva added that their fish are imported at the sac-fry stage, are screened for disease, are accompanied by a health certificate, are quarantined for 30 days, and the transport water is chlorinated and properly disposed of.

Advisory Committee member, Dr. Sarah Park, asked the PQB if the disease issue is addressed through quarantine only or does the PQB verify that a shipment comes from safe areas and that the quarantine is an additional safeguard to prevent the introduction of diseases. Mr. Oliva said that Tilapia Lake Virus is a new disease that they are concerned about, and he wouldn't import fish from area that is "hot" for this disease because if they were to get a disease into their system, it would be financially detrimental. He added that they would ensure that there is a current disease certification before importation and that they would follow their quarantine protocols to prevent disease introduction. Acting Chief Yasui said that if a disease risk exists in a particular region, the Advisory Committee can recommend to the Board of Agriculture to restrict shipments from those regions, and if the Board establishes restriction in the permit conditions, then that is something that the PQB will enforce. Advisory Committee member Park said that it seems that the issue of invasiveness has been addressed, however, she believes that the disease issued raised by Dr. Yamasaki is valid, and that it is a concern. Advisory Committee member Matsui asked why the issue of Mozambique tilapia from Thailand is relevant when the request under review is for Nile tilapia, and asked Mr. Oliva if he plans to import Nile tilapia from Thailand. Mr. Oliva said that there is a Nile strain in Thailand, but he doesn't plan on importing Nile tilapia from Thailand (the phone connection was poor, and the entirety of Mr. Oliva's entire statement was not clear). Advisory Committee member Park said that it sounds like Advisory Committee member Pang's concerns could be addressed if the Advisory Committee recommends that a restriction be placed on where the fish are imported from. Mr. Matsui said that disease testing will reduce the risk of disease introduction into the state, and that there is a self-policing aspect because no one wants to buy from a diseased area and import something that may threaten the importer's crop. Mr. Matsui asked if the Tilapia Lake Virus is on the OIE list. Acting Specialist Lancaster confirmed that the disease is on the OIE list. Chairperson Hoffman suggested to the Advisory Committee that, to address the disease risk from Thailand, that a motion

should be made to remove Nam Sai as a shipper from the request. Advisory Committee member Matsui agreed and said that the applicant is not planning on buying Nile tilapia from there anyway.

Chairperson Hoffman asked Mr. Oliva if his intention is to phase out Mozambique tilapia production or to produce Mozambique and Nile tilapia. Mr. Oliva stated that the initial phase would be to grow both Mozambique and Nile tilapia, and to eventually phase out Mozambique (Mr. Oliva's phone connection was cut off). Advisory Committee member Matsui said that in most cases, Nile tilapia grows out to market size in 6 months while Mozambique tilapia grows out in 12 months; therefore, twice the amount of food is required for Mozambique tilapia as compared to Nile tilapia. He added that if the growers' production costs can be cut in half, it will give Hawaii growers a better chance of being competitive in the market and it is less costly to the environment because there is less input and less waste.

Advisory Committee member Neilson said that there was a risk assessment done on the invasiveness of *O. niloticus* and it was found to have a moderate to high risk of invasiveness. He added that from his understanding, there is possibly a stream on Hawaii island where *O. niloticus* is found, but *O. mossambicus* and black chin tilapia are the species that predominantly occur throughout the state. Advisory Committee member Neilson said that we need to ensure that there are no *O. niloticus* introductions to the wild. He asked Mr. Oliva how he would ensure that theft or smuggling would not occur at his facility where, for example, a bucket of *O. niloticus* could leave the facility and get into backyard aquaponics that may not have the same safeguards that he has at his facility. Mr. Oliva said that they have various safeguards in place, including staff on property 24 hours of every day, cameras, triple fencing, a large property, limited visitor access, and tight security. He stated that the facility is owned by Kohala Institute, with a partnership with Arizona State University. Mr. Oliva said that none of the product leaving the facility is alive, but somewhere down the line, Kohala Mountain Fish Company is looking to do a co-op where they could transfer live fish to a state-licensed farmer that is permitted to receive the fish.

Advisory Committee member Redman made a motion to recommend to the Board to approve the import request and request to establish permit conditions, with the provision that Nam Sai Farm Limited not be allowed as a shipper.

Acting Chief Yasui asked the Advisory Committee to clarify if the recommended prohibition is for the shipper or the region (Thailand). Advisory Committee member Park suggested that the prohibition should be on imports from Thailand, due to Dr. Yamasaki's concerns regarding disease risks from Thailand. Acting PQB Manager Jonathan Ho said that a permit condition should be included to address the risk of imports from Thailand and suggested that the proposed condition should read: Introduction of the restricted article(s) from the country of Thailand, or any country which presents a high-risk for disease introduction into the state, is prohibited. Advisory Committee member Redman concurred with Acting Manager Ho's proposed condition,

## HDOA Advisory Committee Minutes – March 6, 2019

as a provision to be included with his motion to recommend approval of the request. Advisory Committee member Park seconded the motion.

Advisory Committee member Pang said that despite the inclusion of the proposed permit conditions to prohibit shipments from Thailand, he would vote no, because he is still uncomfortable with the high risk that Nile tilapia presents. Advisory Committee member Neilson also stated that he is also uncomfortable with the high risk that Nile tilapia presents and would vote no. Chairperson Hoffman called for a vote.

Vote: APPROVED: 4/6

DISAPPROVED: 2/6

Motion failed.

Deputy Attorney General Jennifer Waihee-Polk said that the Advisory Committee needs 5 votes in favor for the motion to carry, so the motion failed. Acting Manager Ho said that the Advisory Committee can make a motion to move this request to the Board with no recommendation because the Advisory Committee is an advisory board, and that the Board will have the summary of the minutes from this meeting and will be able to review the comments and concerns of the Advisory Committee before making a decision.

Advisory Committee member Matsui asked Advisory Committee member Pang and Neilson if their reason for voting no is because of disease risk or the potential risk of adding new genetic material to the *O. niloticus* already established in the environment, if the fish were to escape or be released. Advisory Committee member Pang said that his vote is due to the risk that the species presents, and also the disease risk because it is unknown what other associated diseases are out there. Advisory Committee member Neilson said that he has the same concerns. He said the fact that Nile tilapia is established in certain places in the state does not justify importing more, and that Hawaii has enough tilapia here and that there is no need to bring more fast-growing tilapia.

Acting Manager Ho said that zero risk is unrealistic, and that another mechanism to potentially reduce risk is to further amend the proposed import permit conditions to disallow live sale and transfer. He added that there is an incentive for Kohala Mountain Fish Company to prevent escape or theft because it would equate to lost money, and that the site is very remote, making theft unlikely.

Advisory Committee member Park said that she attended the meeting on behalf of the Department of Health Director Dr. Bruce Anderson, who felt that this request should be approved, and that his only real concern was that there were appropriate restrictions and safeguards in place. She added that from her perspective, the disease concerns seem to have been addressed by the recommended prohibition on imports from Thailand, as well as the quarantine requirement. Advisory Committee member Park said that only so much can be done to mitigate risk, and that we can only just hope that we have enough safeguards in place, such as the suggestion to prohibit the sale of

## HDOA Advisory Committee Minutes – March 6, 2019

live fish. She also said that the Director does not believe that invasiveness is an issue because the species already occurs in Hawaii, but that his greatest concerns are for the disease risk, and that appropriate restrictions and safeguards are in place for the shipper and importer to ensure that there is limited potential for introduction into the environment.

(Dr. Sarah Park was excused from the Advisory Committee Meeting at 2:44 P.M.)

Advisory Committee member Pang asked Acting Manager Ho if he visited the facility and if it is secure from outsiders. Acting Manager Ho said that finding the property is pretty difficult. It is a large property with fencing, multiple gates, cameras, a lot of workers around, and it is a very remote location. Advisory Committee member Pang asked if the closest body of water is the Pacific Ocean, because he knows Kohala has many streams with a lot of native gobies. Acting Manager Ho said that there is a gulch that runs along the facility that may have water from time to time, but that it is not a perennial stream.

Advisory Committee member Neilson agreed with Acting Manager Ho's assessment that there is no such thing as zero risk and said that is why the DLNR supports the import of other species for aquaculture, such as the carp request reviewed by the Advisory Subcommittee, and an import request for another fish species that was recently approved by the Board of Agriculture. He added that if the DLNR's risk assessment says that this species is a moderate to high risk and is a known invasive species throughout the world, the DLNR cannot support the import of a species that will have a negative impact on our aquatic ecosystem.

Chairperson Hoffman asked the Advisory Committee if there is additional information that would help change the no vote to yes votes. Advisory Committee member Pang requested the results of the DLNR risk assessment and suggested that it be shared with the applicant as well. Deputy Waihee-Polk asked if there is anything the PQB can do with the request, such as including further restrictions such as a prohibition on live transfer or sale and/or provide additional information.

Advisory Committee member Pang asked if the applicant has a track record of importing tilapia, and if so, was anything found during quarantine and testing, and what was done with that. Acting Chief Yasui said that the applicant has imported Mozambique tilapia, and there haven't been any issues that the PQB is aware of such as disease outbreaks and escapes, and that the facility has passed all of the PQB site inspections. Acting Chief Yasui added that the lack of a track record was a concern that the Board for a different import request made by Kohala Mountain Fish Company, and their Mozambique tilapia operation points to their ability to successfully raise tilapia. Advisory Committee member Pang asked if the Mozambique tilapia that were imported were from Thailand. Acting Chief Yasui said that the Thailand shipper was a listed shipper on the permit application, and he believes that the applicant does import Mozambique tilapia from Thailand, but that he believes that Mr. Oliva has domestic shippers as well. Acting Manager Ho said that he believes that a lot of the Mozambique

tilapia that Mr. Oliva imports is from Thailand. Advisory Committee member Pang said that if tests from those Mozambique shipments from Thailand showed no signs of Tilapia Lake Virus, that it would lessen his concern.

Hearing no further discussion, Chairperson Hoffman made a motion to defer the request until the next meeting in order to obtain more information from the DLNR regarding invasiveness, and more information from the applicant, such as disease testing records for Mozambique tilapia, to establish a disease status for the applicant's Thailand shipper, and to determine what actions were taken if disease was found and/or if there were any escapes from the facility. Advisory Committee member Pang seconded the motion. Chairperson Hoffman called for a vote.

Vote: APPROVED: 5/0

(Recess taken at 2:58 P.M.)

(Meeting reconvened at 3:04 P.M.)

Request to: (1) Allow the Importation of Grass Carp, *Ctenopharyngodon idella*, a Fish on the List of Restricted Animals (Part B), by Permit, for Aquaculture Production, by Alii Agriculture Farms LLC; and (2) Update Permit Conditions for the Importation of Grass Carp, *Ctenopharyngodon idella*, a Fish on the List of Restricted Animals (Part B), by Permit, for Aquaculture Production, by Alii Agriculture Farms LLC.

Advisory Committee member Mr. Kenneth Matsui stated that the import of Grass Carp was allowed in the past for various purposes and asked what happened to change that. Acting Specialist Techie Lancaster said the Plant Quarantine Branch (PQB) needs to update the import permit conditions to current standards, and that the proposed conditions add more regulations to address disease and other environmental concerns. Advisory Committee Member Brian Neilson asked if Grass Carp had recently been added to the List of Restricted Animals (Part B). Acting Specialist Lancaster replied that Grass Carp was not recently added to the Restricted B list, and that it is allowed for aquaculture. Advisory Committee member Matsui asked if live sale to restaurants is permitted. Acting Specialist Lancaster said that the current import permit conditions do not allow live transfer; however, Mr. Thee is requesting the ability to transfer live Grass Carp for the purpose of live display and food preparation.

Advisory Committee member Neilson referred to Attachment 1 regarding triploid testing and asked if the blood of every fish is tested. Mr. Thee responded, "yes". Mr. Neilson asked Mr. Thee if he is requesting to import the non-USFWS certified triploid Grass Carp, to which Mr. Thee responded that he is. Advisory Committee member Matsui said that the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS) charges overtime



and a fee for certification which greatly increases the associated import costs. Advisory Committee member Benton Pang asked why triploid Grass Carp are being required now and why it was not been required in the past. Advisory Committee member Matsui said that Advisory Subcommittee member Andrew Rossiter recommended that USFWS certification be required, but that the applicant requests that USFW triploid certification not be required. Advisory Committee Chairperson Kevin Hoffman asked the applicant if he has imported non-certified USFWS Grass Carp before. Mr. Thee said that he only imported non-USFWS certified triploid Grass Carp. Acting Specialist Lancaster clarified that Mr. Thee did not import USFWS-certified triploid Grass Carp with his previous permits. Advisory Committee member Neilson asked Mr. Thee if he is requesting to import Grass Carp that have a 98 percent chance of being triploid, to which Mr. Thee replied, "yes". Acting Chief Trenton Yasui said that the only way that the PQB can verify the fish are triploid is if another government agency certifies it. Advisory Committee Member Pang asked why this was not an issue for the previous Grass Carp permit conditions. Acting Chief Yasui said that he was not involved in the process when the original permit conditions were established; however, appropriate language must be included in the proposed permit conditions if the PQB is expected to enforce the triploid certification requirement.

Advisory Committee member Matsui asked Mr. Thee if a restriction on live sale would be a deal killer for his Grass Carp plans. Mr. Thee said it would be a deal killer because his customers want to display live fish, and that dead fish are not worth anything because people will not buy it.

Advisory Committee Chairperson Hoffman asked Mr. Thee if he transferred live fish under his previous permit. Mr. Thee replied that he did previously sell live fish. Chairperson Hoffman stated that the conditions for his previous permit prohibited live transfer and asked if the Department authorized the live transfer. Acting Chief Yasui stated that to his knowledge, the live transfer was not authorized by the Department. Advisory Committee member Neilson asked if any Advisory Committee members had concerns with allowing the live transfer of Grass Carp. Advisory Committee member Matsui said that he did not have any concerns.

Acting Chief Yasui said the main issue to consider is that if the Advisory Committee is going to recommend that triploid certification be required, it will increase Mr. See Ba Thee's import costs, which may be prohibitive to his operation. Acting Chief Yasui added that the approval recommendation of two of the Advisory Subcommittee members was contingent upon the importation of triploid Grass Carp. Advisory Committee member Pang asked if the Advisory Committee is able to recommend that a non-government triploid certification be accepted. Acting Chief Yasui said that if a non-government triploid certification is allowed, then there would be no need for triploid certification because there would be no way for the PQB to legitimately verify that the imported fish are triploid. Advisory Committee member Neilson asked if there is a way to verify if fish are triploid with a random blood sample when the fish are imported. Acting Chief Yasui said he does not think it is possible at this time because he does not believe that the University of Hawaii and the PQB are set up for that kind of testing at

this time. Advisory Committee member Redman asked how an expert can tell if a fish is triploid. Advisory Committee member Neilson said that, per Attachment 1, a Coulter Counter is used to determine the exact ploidy of the fish.

Advisory Committee member Pang pointed out that Advisory Subcommittee member Dr. Lei Yamasaki stated that it takes two years of negative disease test results to establish that a facility is disease-free and asked if there have been periodic inspections of Mr. Thee's facility for disease. Acting Chief Yasui said that as a part of periodic post-entry inspections, Mr. Thee's fish were inspected for signs and symptoms of disease; however, there has not been any disease testing done at Mr. Thee's facility because his previous import permit conditions did not require them, hence the need to update conditions.

Mr. Neilson asked Mr. Thee if Keo Fish Farm only produces triploid Grass Carp. Mr. Thee said that they probably have other species, such as big and small mouth bass and diploid carp to incubate the triploid.

Referring to Advisory Subcommittee member Mr. LeRoy Thom's recommendation, Advisory Committee member Redman asked Mr. Thee if he has any problem with changing the word "customary" to "imperative" in his procedure so that it states, "It is imperative that the vendor will kill...". Mr. Thee agreed to this change. Chairperson Hoffman asked how the requirement to kill the fish would be enforced. Acting Specialist Lancaster said Mr. Thee's vendors would be required to apply for a possession permit which would have conditions requiring the permittee to kill the fish. Acting Chief Yasui clarified that Mr. Thee's customers would have to apply for a possession permit, and that the issuance of a possession permit and permit conditions would have to be approved by the Board. He added that the PQB would propose possession permit conditions that would require that Mr. Thee's customers would have to kill the fish prior to sale.

Chairperson Hoffman expressed concern that previous import permit conditions were violated when the fish were sold live. Chairperson Hoffman asked Mr. Thee what assurances the Advisory Committee has that new permit conditions will not be violated, given that he violated the conditions of his two previous permits, when he sold live fish. Mr. Thee replied that he has no problem with complying with regulation requiring that his customers obtain a permit. He expressed concern that too much regulation would deter his customers from buying fish from him and inhibit the farmers' ability to produce food for Hawaii's people. He urged that common sense should be used and that regulation should be sensitive to the people. Advisory Committee member Matsui said that Hawaii needs to produce more fish for local consumption because Hawaii's water quality tends to be cleaner than the rest of the world, resulting in a higher quality product. Chairperson Hoffman replied that he is all for enhancing agriculture in Hawaii, but the issue is that should the permit be approved, that permit conditions are followed, because they exist for a reason, which is to protect the environment, and not to hurt the producer or the customer.

Inspector Yasui said that while he believes that Mr. Thee's operation follows strict standard and is a reputable business, once this application and conditions are approved, our rules allow the PQB to administratively issue permits. Therefore, the Advisory Committee needs to consider the next farmer or the weakest link who might not be as reputable as Mr. Thee when making recommendations for approval and establishing permit conditions.

Advisory Committee member Pang highlighted two issues. The first was the issue of requiring USFWS triploid certification if Mr. Thee is not willing to pay for it, and the second was the issue of how Mr. Thee's customers can have live fish swimming in the tanks at a restaurant if they're killed immediately upon transfer. Mr. Thee replied that the fish will be kept alive in a tank until it is ordered by a customer, at which time it will be killed and served to the customer dead. Inspector Yasui said that the PQB has conditions for display and food preparation, which would be a purpose similar to this request.

Mr. Thee stated that he has also received requests from golf courses to supply them with fish for weed control in their water features. Advisory Committee member Matsui argued that the ability to control the theft of Grass Carp from a golf course is limited, which makes the live transfer of Grass Carp to golf courses a tricky proposition. Advisory Committee member Neilson asked if the transfer of live Grass Carp to a golf course a violation of the proposed permit conditions. Acting Chief Yasui stated that permit condition number 1, page 8, of the submittal does restrict live transfer or sale to those who will use them for the purpose of live display and food preparation, so that does eliminate the ability to transfer live Grass Carp to a golf course.

Hearing no further discussion, Committee Chairperson Hoffman called for a motion. Advisory Committee member Redman made a motion to recommend that the Board approve the request to: (1) allow the importation of Grass Carp, *Ctenopharyngodon idella*, a fish on the List of Restricted Animals (Part B), by permit, for aquaculture production, by Alii Agriculture Farms, LLC.; and (2) update permit conditions for the importation of Grass Carp, *Ctenopharyngodon idella*, a fish on the List of Restricted Animals (Part B), by permit, for aquaculture production, by Alii Agriculture Farms, LLC., with one provision that the applicant's procedure is changed regarding the disposition of the fish when it is sold to Mr. Thee's customers, whereby the Mr. Thee's procedures states that "it is imperative that the vendor will then kill..." instead of stating "it said it is customary that the vendor will then kill...". The motion was seconded by Mr. Matsui.

Advisory Committee member Pang asked for clarification that the motion to recommend approval does not include a requirement for USFWS triploid certification, because he does not support requiring certification due to the added cost. Chairperson Hoffman confirmed that the conditions, as proposed, do not require USFWS triploid certification. Committee Chairperson Hoffman called for a vote.

Vote: APPROVED: 5/0

VI. ADJOURNMENT

Having no further business, Committee member Pang moved to adjourn the meeting. The motion was seconded by Chairperson Hoffman, and the Advisory Committee unanimously voted in favor to adjourn. The meeting was adjourned at 3:45 P.M.

Respectfully Submitted,



Karen Hiroshige  
Advisory Committee Secretary