



Minutes of the Board of Agriculture November 26, 2024

4 5 6

A video recording of this meeting can be found online by visiting this website: https://hdoa.hawaii.gov/meetings-reports/

7 8 9

10

CALL TO ORDER – The meeting of the Board of Agriculture was called to order on November 26, 2024, at 9:05 am by Board of Agriculture Chairperson, Sharon Hurd. The meeting was conducted virtually via Zoom and in-person from:

11 12 13

14

15

State of Hawaii, Department of Agriculture Plant Quarantine Branch 1849 Auiki Street

16 17

Members Present In-Person:

Sharon Hurd, Chairperson, Board of Agriculture

19 20 21

22

23 24

25

27 28

29

30

18

Members Virtually Present: Roll call/alone

Ryan Kanaka'ole, DLNR, Ex-Officio Member

Dr. Parwinder Grewal, Dean CTAHR, Ex-Officio Member

Dane Wicker, DBEDT, Ex-Officio Member - Left the meeting at 11:28 am; Joined

at 11:33 am

Diane Ley, Hawaii Member 26

Nathaniel Oswald, Maui County Member

Fred Cowell, Kauai Member – Joined the meeting at 10:50 am

Randy Cabral, Member-at-Large

En Young, Member-at-Large – Left the meeting at 11:13 am

James Gomes, Member-at-Large

31 32 33

Excused:

34 35 36

Deputy Attorney General Present In-Person:

37 DAG Bryan Yee 38

None

DAG Kelcie Nagata

39

40 Others Present In-Person:

Esther Riechert. HDOA/Pesticides 41 Scott Nishimoto, HDOA/Pesticides 42

Wil Leon Guerrero, HDOA/PQ 43

Board of Agriculture Meeting November 26, 2024 Page 2

1 2 3 4 5 6 7	Brandi Ah-Yo, HDOA/ARM Beryl Manliguis, HDOA/ARM Jerome Yasuhara, HDOA/ARM Saguna Verma, University of Hawaii Jason Azus-Richardson, HDOA/IT Marci Clingan, HDOA/Chair's Office
8	Others Virtually Present:1
9	Saguna Verma
10	FIN - Stacey
11	Senator Herbert M "Tim" Richards III
12	Greg Takeshima
13	Jonathan Ho
14	Office of Sen. DeCoite
15	AGR Matsukawa Dean
16	ChunKB
17 18	lindsey.ancog ezamora
19	Reggie Garcia-(Office of Senator Richards)
20	Hubert Olipares
21	Brian Miyamoto
22	Rae Geé
23	Senator DeCoite
24	Thomas Heaton
25	James McCully's iPhone (2)l
26	Douglas Chin
27	J Ferrer, HDOA
28	Yuichiro Tanaka
29	Dexter Kishida, Hawaii Department of Agriculture
30 31	Dana, Hawaiʻi ʻUlu Co-op Judson Laird
32	Stephanie
33	janet
34	H&L Terada Farms
35	HDOAPIO
36	HDOAPIO
37	Roy Hasegawa
38	lyumm
39	Jill Scheibe
40	Dexter Kishida, HDOA
41	
42	

¹ The identification of the public members is based on their sign-in name but are not verified.

1 2 3 4 5 6	II.	APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM October 22, 2024, MEETING		
	Motio	n to Approve: Gomes/Ley		
	Vote:	Approved; Unanimously – 9		
7 8 9	III.	INTRODUCTIONS		
10 11	IV.	COMMUNICATIONS FROM DIVISIONS AND ADMINISTRATION		
12 13		A. AGRICULTURAL LOAN DIVISION		
14 15 16		 Request for Approval of One (1) Class A Loan for Tai Shan Farms, Inc; William Kevin Begemann and Aida Esther Zamora Co-Borrowers 		
17 18	Jillian Scheibe, Ag Loan Division, presented testimony as submitted.			
19 20 21	Motion to Approve: Ley/Gomes			
22 23 24 25 26	Discussion: Member Cabral asked if the parcel amounts can be explained since the parcel values were different. He also asked why the projection on the farm income was substantially less and what is the difference between the three years and their projection.			
27 28 29 30 31 32	Ms. Scheibe said they don't have the same volume of sales since they moved away from the farmer's market. They are saving a lot on labor costs. She added that there is a difference between the loan and property value because they bought Taishan Farms and its' branding as well. The tax accessor gives stuff for permitted features. The brand power of the Taishan Farms and all the marketing that have been built up by the predecessor was included in those values as well.			
33 34	Vote:	Approved; Unanimously – 9		
35 36 37 38	Chairperson Hurd went out of order from the agenda due to time constraints. The board heard item C.6 during this time.			
39 40		B. PLANT INDUSTRY DIVISION		

Pesticides Branch

1. Proposed amendment to list of state restricted use pesticides to include new active ingredient, Flupyradifurone

Scott Nishimoto and Esther Riechert, Pesticides Branch, presented testimony as submitted.

Motion to Defer: Ley/Cabral

Discussion:

Janet Ashman, speaking on behalf of the Hawaii Farm Bureau (HFB), said they are concerned about this proposal. They have serious concerns about the way the October 7th meeting was conducted. The meeting consisted new members to the committee who were not provided orientation or communication about how the meeting would work or what their roles were. She said there were many questions, and they were not answered, and a motion was made prematurely. She added that she tried to make a motion to not restrict it until a groundwater review was done not using the controversial model since at least 2010. That model has problems and it's going to be looked at and the UH has a contract to do that. She also said the draft minutes were not complete but there was a 5-4 vote and that the members were very confused about the process about what was happening. Once the vote was taken, another motion was not made to do the opposite. She said the process seems to be backwards. She stated again that the motion is premature. She said the EPA classifies this pesticide as a reduced risk pesticide and it poses less risk to human's health and the environment than other pesticides allowed for the same use.

Greg Takeshima, Plant Industry Division, responded to Janet's testimony and said he can provide that there are 11 states that have restricted the use of neonicotinoids. The restrictions are very narrow and are usually home, lawn care, and ornamental use. Those restrictions are not for agricultural use.

 Judson Laird said he's been involved with large scale agricultural pest control in Hawaii. He said because Hawaii doesn't have a winter, it's increasingly challenging to manage the insect population. He added that Flupyradifurone was introduced in 2014 as one of the newer pesticides and is highly selective and considered safe on beneficials. Other general use products are made in the 1950s which some are dangerous for our environment and ruins our ecosystem. He added that he supports more funding to find out if this is a danger to the environment and he would like to restrict it if it is.

Matt Lyum said he is representing himself as a concerned citizen. He said he has a restricted use pesticides license but said he will not use anything on the RUP list because it then becomes vilified. He added that putting this on the list before doing

studies is going to make their ability to use these new chemistries even more difficult.

The landscape industry is dealing with CRB and the only effective treatment they have now is neonicotinoids. He concluded that they need all the tools that they can to fight invasive species that are attacking our environment, and we need these new chemistries to help us. Once this gets put on the RUP list, they'll never going to use it.

Esther Riechert, Pesticides Branch, said the modeling system they used was developed in collaboration with DOH and UH's Water Resource Branch. She said the majority of the other states that have responded, require the applicator to be licensed with the state if they are using the product for commercial use. This is not the case for Hawaii. Each state has their own unique situation in which they can further restrict active ingredients.

Janet Ashman said this product is not a noenicitinoid.

 Matt Lyum said the National Association of Landscape professionals have a national test, but said they dropped the pesticides training and was told that every state except for Hawaii requires commercial applicators of all pesticides to have a commercial license. A lot of states require commercial certification which is a different lower level. He added that he thinks Hawaii should have commercial applicators trained. He also said the labels have also been confusing.

Deputy AG Yee reminded everyone that the motion is to defer the matter.

Member Young said the Advisory Committee didn't feel like they had time to really vet this and he is concerned that the board defers this into nothing with no timeline. He said we need to have a resolution. He said he wants the committee's recommendation to be well thought and well considered. He wants to kick this back to the committee with a timeline if possible.

 Member Oswald asked if there has been a previous pesticide that was added to an RUP list and then rescinded later and if there is any evidence of negative impact. He also asked if there are any alternatives and what's the benefit of making it an RUP. He said this needs to be deferred with a lot more research done on this.

Member Cabral said his recommendation is that this should go back to the Pesticide Advisory Committee for them to do a better review and come back with a recommendation.

Member Gomes said we need more adequate review time and more research and education. He also agrees that this should be deferred.

Member Grewal also agreed with what has been said and more research should be done.

Member Gomes added he wants a response from those that did not respond.

Member Ley clarification in the process would be good. She said when these highly technical issues come before the board, it requires significant scientific understanding and therefore she relies on being provided sufficient information to make an informed decision. She said she'd like the specifics noted in the minutes and that the Plant Industry Advisory Group provides some translation of that science which has been helpful to her. She said it raised red flags when she saw the close vote and how one wasn't recorded.

Esther Riechert said it would be hard to track the usage of the products with Flupyradifurone because it's general use and they don't have the data for that. She said they'll try to address the other points at the Pesticides Advisory Committee.

Member Oswald asked if we could look at sales to know how much is imported.

Ms. Riechert said we can request sales data, but we don't have the authority to mandate that. We can track RUP for that information.

Mr. Nishimoto said we'd have this information if the marketplace surveillance inspection is conducted by inspectors and a violation was observed. The inspector could go back to the retailer to request for sales invoices or receipts. Other than that, we wouldn't have any information on importation of general use pesticides if there is no violation that has occurred.

Member Ley asked what the source of funding for groundwater modeling is as well as specific studies for pesticides. Does the branch fund this or do they need to partner with DOH or UH?

Mr. Nishimoto said majority of the contracts that Pesticides have are typically funded with the Pesticides Revolving Fund. The groundwater review study has not been budgeted for FY 2025. We could tap into trust funds from the Monsanto settlement.

Chairperson Hurd said they're using the Pesticides Use Revolving Fund (PURF) to test water but with the concern that the funding from the Federal side will be cut, we are wondering how to fund future programs.

Mr. Nishimoto said we have 3 positions in the Pesticides Branch that are federally funded and he has expressed concerns about federal funds being cut.

Greg Takeshima said some of the discussion in the Advisory Committee on Pesticides revolved around \$400,000 for on the ground, in field experiment to verify groundwater

1 leaching. Is that an effective use for one specific active ingredient? We would potentially 2 be spending a large amount of money for each active new ingredient. The branch is 3 statutorily required to ensure that the environment is watched over. If anyone wants to 4 go into details, he said they can reach out to him. 5 Member Cabral asked Mr. Nishimoto if the PURF funds were taken into general funds 6 7 when they cut back the special funds from all the departments? 8 9 Mr. Nishimoto said the funds are fees that we collect from certifications or penalties. He said the PURF fund had been used to pay for majority of the positions in the Pesticides 10 11 Branch but the funding for these positions had been moved to General funds to pay for 12 the position. 13 14 Mr. Takeshima said we are statutorily required to put back anything above \$1 million in the PURF back into the general use fund. He added that the branch put in a request 15 16 through executive legislation to increase the cap for the PURF from \$1 million to \$3 17 million. Now that staffing is removed, we are trying to bump up projects to assist 18 industry. 19 20 Chairperson asked how long it might take to gather the data and statistics and for the 21 board request to come back in. 22 23 Mr. Takeshima said the intent is to hold the next Advisory Committee Meeting in 24 February. He said that they can do a better job in terms of preparing the advisory 25 committee.

26 27

Member Ley agreed that she would like to change her motion to defer until a date after February.

28 29 30

Member Cabral seconded the motion.

31 32

Motion to defer this matter until a date after February 2025: Ley/Cabral

33 34

Vote: Deferred; Unanimously – 9

35 36

Plant Quarantine Branch

37 38 39

40

41 42

43

2. Request to: (1) Allow the Importation and Possession of Monkeypox Virus, Clade IIb, on the List of Restricted Microorganisms (Part A), for Laboratory Research, By the University of Hawaii; (2) Establish Permit Conditions for the Importation and Possession of Monkeypox Virus, Clade IIb, on the List of Restricted Microorganisms (Part A), by Permit, for Laboratory

Research, by the University of Hawaii; (3) Determine if the Permit Conditions are Sufficient to Assure the Possession of Monkeypox Virus Clade IIb, for Laboratory Research by the University of Hawaii, by Permit, Presents Minimal to No Significant Impact on the Environment

Wil Leon Guerrero presented testimony as submitted.

Motion to Approve: Wicker/Gomes

- 10 Discussion:
- 11 Member Wicker asked if a variety of this virus has been imported through this process 12 before.

Mr. Guerrero said we've had other viruses go through the board, but not this specific virus.

Member Wicker said it's good to know that there are partnerships between our UH lab.

Member Young said he applauds UH as a leader in this research field. He asked why the Monkeypox virus?

Ms. Saguna Verma, Professor at the UH, said in her field, you want to keep working on new pathogens because viruses change. The Monkeypox virus was once restricted to one area in Africa but in 2022, the virus changed, and it became less severe. This Clade 2B has now spread to the US in 2022, and it has spread to 120 countries. She added that we have the expertise, motivation, and determination to do research and provide new insights which will help the public health and the clinical faculty to manage.

Member Oswald asked how do you ensure this doesn't go out and spread?

Ms. Verma said we are only asking to import this virus for doing invitro lab work and not animal work. It's highly unlikely to get others infected because it is not airborne like other viruses. Every student handling the virus will be vaccinated and it'll protect them. The SOP is very well established. She said they have double gloves, masks, gowns and booties so there is no way that they are exposed. The live virus never sees the outside of the cabinet. They have one of the most rigorous trainings in the U.S. There is also a buddy system so no one will work alone.

Member Oswald asked if there is a protocol in place for worst case scenario.

Ms. Verma said in case they feel there is a possibility of exposure, that person will be immediately monitored and will be placed in isolation.

Mr. Guerrero said if there is an accidental release or exposure, UH is required to report that to DOA. If there is a major natural disaster, they'll need to destroy what they're working on.

Vote: Approved; Unanimously - 9

The board went into a recess at 10:29 am

The board went back into session at 10:45 am

C. AGRICULTURAL RESOURCE MANAGEMENT DIVISION

1. Request for Approval to: (1) Eurus to Subdivide TMK: (1) 9-1-031:001 Including General Lease S-3138, Hawaii Land & Livestock, LLC, into Two Parcels Consisting of 18 and 92.106 Acres, Respectively; (2) Modify General Lease S-3138; Hawaii Land & Livestock, LLC, Contingent upon Completion of the Subdivision of TMK: (1) 9-1-031:001, Reflecting a Reduction in Area from 110.106 to 18 Acres; and (3) Support Withdrawal of Governor's Executive Order 4584 (Dated May 15, 2019) Approximately 92.106 acres, More or Less, for Reversion to the Department of Land and Natural Resources Contingent upon Completion of Both (i) the Subdivision of TMK (1) 9-1-031:001 and (ii) the Modification and Approval of General Lease S-3138; Hawaii Land & Livestock, LLC, Hono`uli`uli, `Ewa, O`ahu, Hawai`i

Chairperson Hurd said at the request of the Hawaii land & Livestock attorney, she will be deferring this matter to a later date. This matter is dependent upon the agreement of multiple parties, including Hawaii Land & Livestock.

2. Request for Acceptance for Annual Renewal of Revocable Permits for TMK Nos.: (1) 4-1-008:071 & 072; (1) 9-4-002:080; (2) 1-1-003:028; (3) 3-1-004:001; (3) 4-6-002:001; (3) 4-7-004:009; (3) 4-9-011:002; (3) 5-5-007:011; (4) 1-9-002:019; (4) 1-9-003:006; (4) 1-9-003:010; (4) 1-9-012:011; (4) 4-1-001:007; (4) 4-1-001:012; and (4) 4-1-009:005 & 006; Statewide

Brandi, Ah-Yo, Property Manager, presented testimony as submitted.

Motion to Approve: Gomes/Wicker

Discussion:

43 Member Gomes asked if any of these have been considered to go to long term.

44 45

1 Ms. Ah-Yo said yes, and she has one in process to do the lease conversion. The majority of these are in this status because it's landlocked parcels so we cannot convert 2 3 to a long-term lease. 4 5 Member Gomes asked if any of the lessees own property and that's why they're land locked? He also asked if they are close by or if they can join. 6 7 8 Ms. Ah-Yo said she can speak for the ones on the Big Island. She said access is an 9 issue and they may have agreements with the neighboring parcels to have access or 10 some may lease a property next door. If they don't own it in fee simple, we haven't done 11 any long-term lease. 12 13 Member Gomes asked why has it been so long to turn it over into a long-term lease? 14 15 Ms. Ah-Yo said there were some issues and a death in the family for one of them. There 16 were some issues with the business aspect of that structure. We might have to go out to 17 the public to bid out on the other property. She said she's working with them to decide if he wants a long-term lease or not. 18 19 20 Vote: Approved; Unanimously - 10 21 22 23 3. Request for Conversion of General Lease No. S-4392; Lois N. Hashimoto, Clyde T. Hashimoto, and Lynne N. Tamashiro, Lessee; TMK: (4) 1-9-001:011, 24 25 Lot 25, Hanapēpē Rice and Kula Lots, Hanapēpē, Waimea (Kona), Island of 26 Kaua'i, Hawai'i 27 28 Brandi Ah-Yo, Property Manager, presented testimony as submitted. 29 30 Motion to Approve: Gomes/Wicker 31 32 Discussion: 33 None 34 35 Vote: Approved; Unanimously - 10 36 37 38 4. Request for Approval to (1) Cancel General Lease Nos. S-9000 and S-9008; 39 William Pfeil, Lessee, (2) Issue the Cancellation Document and (3) Dispose of 40 the Parcels to the Public by Negotiation; TMKs: (2) 5-2-001:010 and 016, 41 Moloka'i Agricultural Park, Ho'olehua, Island of Moloka'i, Hawai'i 42

Brandi Ah-Yo, Property Manager, presented testimony as submitted.

Motion to Approve: Gomes/Cowell

4	F. Damiest for Consent to Mortrone, Consent Loose No. C 2002, House N. H.			
1 2 3 4	 Request for Consent to Mortgage; General Lease No. S-3003; Hawai`i 'Ulu Producers Cooperative, Lessee; TMK: (3) 7-9-016:018 and 019, Honalo, North Kona, Island of Hawai'i, Hawai'i 			
5 6	Brandi Ah-Yo, Property Manager, presented testimony as submitted.			
7 8	Motion to Approve: Gomes/Wicker			
9	Discussion:			
10 11	Ms. Ah-Yo said we need to put a consent to put in a mortgage which puts a lien on the property.			
12 13 14 15	Member Ley said if the co-op was to default, are the assets the equipment and not the infrastructure?			
16 17	Ms. Ah-Yo said yes, that's her understanding. They also have the guaranteed as an extra layer of protection.			
18				
19	Member Young recused himself.			
20 21 22	Vote: Approved – 9; Recused – 1 (Young)			
23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30	6. Request to: (1) Rescind Prior Board Action Approving Assignment of General Lease No. S-4775; Henry M. Terada and Loraine Y. Terada, Lessee/Assignor; Jianguo Wang, Assignee; and (2) Request to Consent to Assignment of General Lease No. S-4775; Henry M. Terada and Loraine Y. Terada, Lessee/Assignor; James William McCully, Assignee; TMK: (3) 2-2-056:054, Lot 28, Pana'ewa Agricultural Park, Waiākea, South Hilo, Island of Hawai'i, Hawai'i			
31 32	Beryl Manliguis, Agricultural Resource Management Division, presented testimon submitted.			
33				
34	Motion to Approve: Ley/Gomes			
35				
36	Discussion:			
37	None			
38 39 40 41	Vote: Approved; Unanimously - 9			
42				
43 44	V. OLD BUSINESS None			

VI. NEW BUSINESS

4 5

1. NON-ACTION ITEM: Invasive Species Action Plan Updates

6 7

Jonathan Ho, Plant Quarantine Manager, presented new business item.

8

10

11 12

13 14

15

16

17

18 19

20 21

22

23

24

25

2627

28

29

30 31

32 33

34

35

Discussion:

Mr. Ho said the legislature provided \$10 million funding to the state for a variety of biosecurity measures. \$1 million was allocated to the CRB response and the RFP went out this month. The proposals are in, and they're being reviewed. \$800,000.00 for Green Waste is closing in December of 2024. \$1.1 million is for LFA and the RFP closed in November as well and the proposals are being reviewed. These are for pest control operators to do treatments for LFA in residential areas. The PQ has already started doing residential surveys with the first survey done on 11/18 and covered about 5 ½ acres. We also have additional residential areas and once the contracts get implemented, we'll have sites that are already ready to go for the treatments. For the Brown Tree Snake Rapid Response, \$240,000 was allocated. The traps get corroded, damaged, and stolen and we'll try to get a galvanized price so we can get the counts needed for distribution. There was a little under \$75,000 for Coqui Frog and it'll be used for citric, and it's currently being used on Kauai and on Oahu. There are some issues with storage and effectiveness, so we are not buying the citric all at once. For the Two-Lined Spittle Bug, the proposals are being reviewed. \$300,000 funds are for the Rose-Ringed Parakeet for Oahu. Act 231 also provided 20 positions statewide and we're doing interviews for 89-day hires since the funds are good for only one year. Lastly, the board did a final approval for 4-72 at the last board meeting. Mr. Ho said he created a very high level 2-page guidance document explaining the intent of the regulation and the quarantine procedures that the department would take prior to the implantation of a guarantine. He said that he can provide this to the board members at our next board meeting. The rules went to Small Business last week and the Hawaii Floriculture and Nursery Association attended and brought up some concerns similar to the board. After discussing with them, they understood what the intent of the regulation was and did recommend approval to the Governor. Mr. Ho added that he will work with the industry to disseminate it and if they need clarification. He will work on that for finalization and distribution.

36 37 38

Member Cabral asked if they will be given updates monthly.

39 40

41 42 Mr. Ho said correct, and he will provide updates to the board members monthly. He said he will provide this update to Marci, and she can email it to the board members. He also said they'll be working with some of the industry representatives to meet with them as well.

1 Member Ley asked if the LFA applications and pest control are solely on Oahu or other 2 islands?

Mr. Ho said the majority of the funds are slated for Oahu, but every island has a piece of that amount. This is for residential.

Member Oswald asked how much of the containers are getting inspected?

 Mr. Ho said depending on the goods, an estimated amount of 10-15% and it's based off regulated commodities that are imported. Statutorily, we have the authority to inspect specific classes of goods at port of entry. These include plants, plant parts, cut flowers, fresh fruit and vegetables and other raw or natural plant materials, non-domestic animals, known cultures of microorganisms and soil.

Member Oswald asked how they treat the item if you found an invasive pest.

 Mr. Ho said the first thing would be to contain the commodity to prevent further escape or spread. Once containment occurs, you'll do identification of the pest. If the pest is not known to occur in the state, the commodity would need to be subjected to treatment that eradicates the pest. The commodity will either be destroyed or will be sent out of state.

Member Oswald asked if sulfuryl fluoride, phosphine mixed with CO2, methyl bromide, and for organic CO2 methods used.

Mr. Ho said it depends on the pest. He said they work with the applicant and the applicant will find a licensed fumigator that is able to provide a treatment that can be approved.

Member Oswald asked how they can better serve HDOA and service these entry points.

 Mr. Ho said we import 90% of our goods and he doesn't see that changing any time soon and as long as there's imports, there is going to be risks. The resources that New Zealand spends is about 10 times the amount of what we do. They focus very heavily on pre-entry which forces as much of the inspections, treatments, compliance, agreements outside the boarder prior to entry. One of the advantages is that they are a country, and we are a state. Finding more staff and the ability to conduct more inspections is the best way. He said there is individual states that have specific requirements for importation on their own. Fleshy fruits can't be exported from the state because of fruit flies. USDA has created a federal quarantine of the State of Hawaii and has precluded the ability for Hawaii to ship most fresh fruit. Each individual state has its' own specific requirements, and we will work with shippers to meet the requirements at

the state level. He added that most states don't have a lot of regulatory structure,

Board of Agriculture Meeting November 26, 2024 Page 15

1 particularly with regards to import. The majority of their time is spent on export while 2 Hawaii spends the majority of our time on import regulation. 3 4 Chairperson Hurd said we can schedule an APHIS speaker or an excursion to talk 5 about this problem that farmers are experiencing. 6 7 Member Gomes asked if we are actively recruiting more staff to help Jonathan. 8 9 Chairperson Hurd said yes. The legislature has supported us with positions, and we'll 10 be going back to them this year to ask for more positions. 11 Motion to adjourn: Gomes/Cowell 12 13 14 The meeting was adjourned at 11:41 am 15 16 Respectfully submitted, 17 18 19 20 Marci Clingan 21